## PressAcademia

## RJBM Research Journal of Business \& Management

PressAcademia publishes journals, books, case studies, conference proceedings and organizes international conferences.
rjbm@pressacademia.org

## ABOUT THE JOURNAL

Research Journal of Business and Management (RJBM) is a scientific, academic, peer-reviewed, quarterly and open-access online journal. The journal publishes four issues a year. The issuing months are March, June, September and December. The publication language of the Journal is English. RJBM aims to provide a research source for all practitioners, policy makers, professionals and researchersworking in all related areas of business, management and organizations. The editor in chief of RJBM invites all manuscripts that cover theoretical and/or applied research on topics related to the interest areas of the Journal.

## Editor-in-Chief <br> Prof. Suat Teker

## Editorial Assistant

Inan Tunc

RJBM is currently indexed/archived by
Ulrich's Directiroy, EuroPub, Open J-Gate, Princeton University Library,
International Scientific Indexing (ISI), Directory of Research Journals Indexing(DRJI), InternationalSociety for Research Activity (ISRA), InfoBaseIndex, Scientific Indexing Services (SIS), Google Scholar, Root Indexing, Journal Factor Indexing, TUBITAK-DergiPark, International Institute of Organized Research (I2OR), SOBIAD.

## Ethics Policy

RJBM applies the standards of Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE). RJBM is committed to the academic community ensuringethics and quality of manuscripts in publications. Plagiarism is strictly forbidden and the manuscripts found to be plagiarised will not be accepted or if published will be removed from the publication.

## Author Guidelines

All manuscripts must use the journal format for submissions. Visit www.pressacademia.org/journals/ribm/guidelines for details.

## CALL FOR PAPERS

The next issue of RJBM will be published in March, 2024.
Submit manuscripts to
ribm@pressacademia.org or
http://www.pressacademia.org/submit-manuscript/
Web: www.pressacademia.org/journals/ribm


## EDITORIAL BOARD

Orhan Akova, Istanbul University, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0001-7740-2938
Adel Bino, University of Jordan, Jordan, ORCID: 0000-0002-96372954
Sebnem Burnaz, Istanbul Technical University, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0002-4845-4031
Isik Cicek, Necmettin Erbakan University, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0003-0870-3811
Cigden Aricigil Cilan, Istanbul University, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0002-7862-7028
Cuney Dirican, Arel University, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0001-6622-3926
Ravindra Dissanayake, University of Kelaniya, Sri Lanca, ORCID: 0000-0003-1631-2765
Gabriel Dwomoh, Kumasi Polytechnic, Gana, ORCID: 0000-0001-9654-7518
Emel Esen, Yildiz Technical University, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0003-5753-3552
Seyed Reza Jalili, Sharif University of Technology, Iran, ORCID: 0000-0002-2618-0332
Pinar Bayhan Karapinar, Hacettepe University, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0003-0534-8885
Selcuk Kendirli, Gazi University, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0001-7381-306X
Yongshi Lu, Sun Yat-Sen University, Taiwan, ORCID: 0000-0001-7150-6904
P. Michael McLain, Hampton University, United States, ORCID: 0000-0002-8697-3377

Ghassan Omet, University of Jordan, Jordan, ORCID: 0000-0002-0163-1387
Tifanie Pulley, Hampton University, United States, ORCID: 0000-0003-3825-3639
Rafisah Mat Radzi, Univiersiti Sains Malaysia, Malaysia, ORCID: 0000-0002-7471-1513
Lihong Song, Shantou University, China, ORCID: 0000-0001-6783-1050
Ab Ghani Teeni, University Technology Mara, Malaysia, ORCID: 0000-0001-6842-7041
Mustafa Turhan, Istanbul Okan University, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0002-7420-1652
Adilya Yamaltdinova, Kyrgyzstan-Turkey Manas University, Kyrgyzstan, ORCID: 0000-0003-1426-5993
Ugur Yozgat, Nisantasi University, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0001-9893-3551


## CONTENT

Title and Author/s ..... Page

1. A bibliometric analysis and review of green transformation
Fulya Tasel, Ebru Beyza Bayarcelik ..... 152-159
DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1831
RJBM-V.10-ISS.4-2023(1)-p.152-159
2. Unraveling the great resignation: a comprehensive literature review on the workforce exodus henomenon
Melike Artar, Yavuz Selim Balcioglu ..... 160-165
DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1832
RJBM-V.10-ISS.4-2023(2)-p.160-165
3. The influence of perceived organisation support on employees' engagement in Tanzania:
a case of SMEs.
Judith J. Msangi ..... 166-173
DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1833
RJBM-V.10-ISS.4-2023(3)-p.166-173
4. Investigation of cyberloafing behavior in terms of various elements: a qualitative study
Nihan Yavuz Aksakal ..... 174-186
DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1834
RJBM-V.10-ISS.4-2023(4)-p.174-186
5. Employees' engagement on the performance of Tanzanian public higher learninginstitutions: a case of institute of social work
Dominic Nkolimwa ..... 187-194
DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1835
RJBM-V.10-ISS.4-2023(5)-p.187-194
6. Music streaming services and the drivers of customer purchase
Mariana Lopes Barata, Jose Monteiro Barata ..... 195-206
DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1836
RJBM-V.10-ISS.4-2023(6)-p.195-206

# A BIBLIOMETRIC ANALYSIS AND REVIEW OF GREEN TRANSFORMATION 

DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1831
RJBM- V.10-ISS.4-2023(1)-p.152-159

## Fulya Tasel ${ }^{1}$, Ebru Beyza Bayarcelik ${ }^{2}$

${ }^{1}$ Maltepe University, International Trade \& Logistics Department, Istanbul, Türkiye. fulyatasel@maltepe.edu.tr, ORCID: 0000-0001-6959-5776
${ }^{2}$ Maltepe University, International Trade \& Logistics Department, Istanbul, Türkiye. ebrubeyzabayarcelik@maltepe.edu.tr , ORCID: 0000-0003-4886-5719
Date Received: July 29, $2023 \quad$ Date Accepted: November 22, $2023 \quad$ open 8 access (cc) By

To cite this document
Tasel, F., Bayarcelik, E.E., (2023). A bibliometric analysis and review of green transformation. Journal of Business and Management (RJBM), 10(4), 152-159.
Permanent link to this document: $\underline{\text { http://doi.org/10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1831 }}$
Copyright: Published by PressAcademia and limited licensed re-use rights only.


#### Abstract

Purpose- The urgent need for environmental sustainability has propelled the world towards a paradigm shift known as the "green transformation". This transformative process aims to reconcile economic development with ecological balance by adopting a holistic approach towards sustainability. At its core, the green transformation revolves around the concept of a "green economy," wherein the production and consumption patterns are aligned with principles of environmental responsibility, resource efficiency, and social equity. Key elements of green transformation examine the various sectors that are undergoing significant changes, such as energy, transportation, agriculture, and urban planning, all driven by the goal of minimizing carbon emissions and ecological footprints. The green transformation seeks to decouple economic growth from environmental degradation by promoting renewable energy sources, implementing circular economy practices, and adopting clean technologies. Methodology- This study employed a bibliometric analysis to examine the existing literature on the investigation and application of green transformation. A total of 905 publications from Scopus and 645 publications from Web of Science databases is analysed. Findings- The findings revealed that interest in the concept of green transformation has grown significantly in academia, both in terms of volume and across various disciplines. Moreover, future research in the field of green transformation is expected to build upon current knowledge regarding technology and sustainability while exploring new frontiers, such as the impact of green transformation in digitalized environments. Conclusion- By employing cutting-edge technologies to delve into current research, this study offers valuable insights to comprehensively grasp recent findings on green transformation. It is important to note that the review's inclusiveness and comprehensiveness were constrained by the size of the selected literature.


Keywords: Green transformation, bibliometric analysis, Web of Science, Scopus, VOSviewer
JEL Codes: Q50, Q55, Q56

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The series of crises, including economic, social and natural, have highlighted immediate and substantive structural changes in global economies. Changes in this crisis include the crucial concept of green transformation, which aims to modernize and increase the competitiveness of national economies while minimizing environmental impact. This transformation encompasses diverse aspects, ranging from the efficient utilization of natural resources to the advancement of environmentally friendly technologies (Cheba, Bak, Szopik-Depczynska, \& loppolo, 2022).

The emergence of "green transformation" literature can be contextualized as a reflection of the growing recognition and concern for global environmental challenges, notably climate change and the depletion of biodiversity (Amundsen \& Hermansen, 2021). The green transformation is a protracted process closely linked to proactive environmental protection policies. These policies not only stimulate the desire for innovative, eco-friendly products, services and technologies but also shape the evolving societal mindset towards sustainability over time.

In the second and third industrialization revolution, economic growth especially relied heavily on the production and consumption of natural resources without thinking limitless of these natural resources. However, this approach has led to a current crisis concerning natural resources, with the looming threat of resource scarcity and continuously rising prices. In
contemporary conditions, countries, institutions and economists are exploring alternative economic models that prioritize environmental preservation while still generating wealth of civilization. This shift reflects the growing recognition of the need for a transition to a green transformation with green economy.

The concept of green transformation refers to the process of transitioning societies, economies, and systems towards sustainability and environmental control. It involves adopting practices and policies that minimize environmental impact, promote resource efficiency, and address climate change. The goal of green transformation is to shift away from unsustainable practices and transition towards a more environmentally friendly and sustainable future.

This paper conducts a thorough examination of the current literature providing an in-depth analysis of key trends, influential works, and emerging themes in the field. The paper then systematically unfolds the outcomes of the bibliometric study, unveiling a structured flow of information that sheds light on the landscape of green transformation research. The paper concludes by emphasizing the significance of the insights derived from this bibliometric analysis and their implications for future research within the field of green transformation.

## 2. LITERATURE REVIEW

In today's competitive conditions, recognizing the direct impact of companies' strategies on the environment, it is essential for them to incorporate environmental responsibility into their long-term strategies. Companies face mounting pressure to compete on multiple fronts-not only meeting environmental requirements and complying with regulations but also distinguishing themselves from competitors and attaining sustainable competitive advantage. Companies that prioritize eco and green innovation by aligning their strategies, resources, capabilities, culture, and knowledge with environmental considerations, can effectively meet these requirements while creating barriers to entry for competitors (Šumakaris, Kovaite; \& Korsakiene, 2023). Integrating environmental issues at the strategic level and embracing eco-friendly business strategies are not merely options but imperatives for companies to thrive in a world marked by heightened environmental consciousness (Hojnik, Ruzzier, \& Manolova, 2018). In this context, strategic management plays a crucial role in driving and integrating green transformation within organizations. It ensures that sustainability goals are aligned with overall strategic objectives, enables resource allocation for green initiatives, manages environmental risks, and engages stakeholders to create a holistic and effective approach to sustainable business practices.

There are various definitions for green transformation that can be defined a narrower sense, it is associated with the concept of green growth, which entails an economic transformation focused on environmental considerations (Berger, 2011). In a broader sense, the term encompasses the idea of sustainable development, which goes beyond the greening of the economy and also encompasses changes in social and environmental dimensions (Gu, Renwick, \& Xue, 2018).

The world is increasingly concerned about environmental changes, and organizations face various obstacles in their efforts to reduce negative environmental impacts. Over the past years, the environment has been severely affected by excessive resource consumption and advanced industrial activities, both of which contribute significantly to the accumulation of environmental pollution (Hanif, Ahmed, \& Younas, 2023). For decades, there has been a strong emphasis, both in theory and practice, on the role of governments in increasing the efficient use of natural resources. Throughout the COVID-19 pandemic, the United Nations and various other organizations have called on all nations to adopt eco-friendly and low-carbon economic recovery strategies and promote a more environmentally sustainable global economy (Guo \& Yuan, 2022). It is a well-known fact that greenhouse gases (GHGs), a major contributor to global warming, have unfavorable effects on both the environment and the socio-economic landscape. As a result, the idea of a green transformation has gained a lot of attention. Striving for sustainable development goals, the idea of green transformation seeks to promote green economic growth. This involves minimizing greenhouse gas emissions and, ideally, moving away from dependence on carbon (Zhao, Guo, \& Feng, 2023). Organizations are consistently prioritizing environmentally friendly innovations to enhance their corporate ecological impact. Their primary objective is to establish a market advantage through a commitment to sustainable environmental practices (Hanif, Ahmed, \& Younas, 2023).
"Green economy" is one of the concepts revealed by long-standing studies that deal with economic growth and development together with ecological sustainability. Therefore, much like the sustainable development discourse that preceded it, proponents of the green economy describe it as a "low carbon, resource efficient and socially inclusive" economy (Death, 2015). The economic activities that started with the industrial revolution changed the natural environment of the world much more deeply than in previous periods. Over the years, we see this impact accelerating to a point where global warming and other ecological limits raise concerns about devastating and irreversible changes in global ecosystems and undermine human ability to sustain civilization. The necessity of meticulously reducing environmental pollution and resource consumption is scientifically indisputable. This includes the use of polluting industries and technologies that recognize the value of natural resources and environmental services, and that separates economic growth from resource consumption, gradually removing pollutants such as greenhouse gases or plastic products (Pegels \& Altenburg, 2020).

The overall green transformation in industries includes the improvement of green industrial structure and the transition to environmentally friendly production. Therefore, by the industrial green transformation, the mis-distribution of existing
natural resources can be reduced, while resources are flowed to the most suitable sectors and used rationally. In addition, the relevant regulation, new energy exploration and use of new resources will emerge under industrial green transformation (IGT) (Zhao, Guo, \& Feng, 2023).

The primary emphasis of green transformation research lies in renewable energies and intelligent energy systems. According to theories with the firm's resource-based perspective, achieving sustainable competitive advantage involves utilizing unique organizational resources or dynamic capabilities. This enables the identification and exploitation of business opportunities, leading to a transformative impact on the organization. However, other scholars place significant emphasis on the critical role of knowledge (Magyari, Zavarko, \& Csedo, 2022).

The first papers that introduced the term "green transformation" within the framework of sustainable development and green growth emerged at the start of the 21st century. Luttropp and his colleagues conducted a study examining the concept of green transformation focusing on products with high performance and business opportunities. Their research concluded that the information society had reached a significant level of environmental knowledge and development, presenting new opportunities to utilize environmental guidelines (Luttropp \& Karlsson, 2001).

Since from Lutropp and Karlsson studies, the concept of green transformation, encompassing economic and environmental aspects, has become an engaging topic of discussion among scholars worldwide. Over the years, the concept of green transformation has developed and been widely explored and debated by numerous scholars and practitioners worldwide. The volume of scientific publications on this topic has been steadily growing and differentiate by regional perspectives, such as China, (Li, et al., 2021), Indonesia, Ghana, Nigeria (Efobi, 2019), UK (Oyedokun, 2015), Norway (Haugseth, 2019), Taiwan and France. On the other side there are also green transformation studies that analyzing individual published studies related to the industrial point of view, specific fields of science and the general approaches. According to industry perspective, several publications have examined the concept of green transformation within the manufacturing sector, the cement industry, the maritime industry and the fashion industry (Wang, Wang, Meng Wang, 2012).

## 3. METHODOLOGY

While investigating the concept of green transformation, which has gained significant popularity and has emerged as a prominent research area, there remains a lack of comprehensive analysis concerning the interplay between the structure, development, collaboration among existing literature, and the clarification of potential research avenues. Consequently, this paper employs a bibliometric analysis of green transformation to comprehensively comprehend and explore the current landscape of research pertaining to the application of green transformation in economy, as well as sustainability and environmental protection implementations. This study follows the bibliometric analysis procedure based on the study of Donthu et al., (2021) which is given in Figure 1.

Figure 1: Bibliometric Analysis Procedure


Source: (Donthu, Kumar, Mukherjee, Pandey, \& Lim, 2021)

The outcomes of this investigation aim to assist scientists, researchers, decision makers identifying research focal points and emerging patterns within the field of green transformation, thereby guiding their future research endeavors. The present study seeks to address the following research inquiries using Web of Science and Scopus databases:

RQ1: In the period of 2001-2023, what trends can be identified in terms of publication quantities, distribution based on topics from green transformation research?

RQ2: Which disciplines and thematic areas stand out as the primary focuses within green transformation research?

## 4. FINDINGS

While searching the studies; the time period between 2001-2023 years were taken and titles, keywords and abstracts search tool were used. In both databases "green transformation" used as a focal keyword. This resulted a sample of 905 from Scopus and 645 from Web of Science databases.

Figure 2: Documents by Year (Source: Scopus)


According to the data obtained from the Scopus database, as seen in Figure 2, the publications have been increasing gradually since 2001. Especially in 2020 the number of publications were 73, in 2021 it was 119 and in 2022 it was 332 which shows the increasing interest to the subject of "green transformation".

Figure 2: Documents by document type (Source: Scopus)


As it is shown in Figure 3 the collected documents included articles, conference papers, book chapters and the others.

Figure 4: Documents by subject area (Source: Scopus)


The Scopus database provides the information about the subject area which gives the mostly studied areas about the topic "Green Transformation". As it is shown in Figure 4 the documents cover mainly 10 different areas and the others. This shows us that although the subject of green transportation seems to be new, several different disciplines are studying and there is a multidisciplinary approach. The most frequent subject areas are "Environmental Studies" (23.0\%), "Engineering" (12.6\%), "Energy" (12.0\%), "Social Sciences" (11.2\%) which together account for almost more than half. Figure 5 shows the most studied areas obtained from the Web of Science database; "Environmental Sciences" ranked first with 307 studies, "Green Sustainable Science Technology" ranked second with 184 studies, and "Environmental Studies" ranked third with 145 studies.

Figure 5: Documents by Subject Area (Source: Web of Science)


Excluding the conference papers, the books and the book chapters between the time period 2001-2023 728 articles listed in Scopus database and the top fifteen journals are listed in Table 1. The first three journals Sustainability Switzerland (total 89\%12), Environmental Science and Pollution Research (total 50-\%7), International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health (total 43-\%6) account for nearly $\% 25$ of the relevant papers (a total of 182). As it can be seen from Table 1 the subject of "Green Transformation" is studied in different areas such as Sustainability, Environmental Science, Energy etc.

Table 1: Top 15 Journals Publishing on Green Transformation

| Sources | Articles |
| :--- | :---: |
| Sustainability Switzerland | 89 |
| Environmental Science and Pollution Research | 50 |
| International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health | 43 |
| Journal of Cleaner Production | 42 |
| Frontiers in Environmental Science | 28 |
| Energies | 14 |
| Resources Policy | 12 |
| Resources and Environment in the Yangtze Basin | 10 |
| Energy | 9 |
| Energy Economics | 9 |
| Environment Development and Sustainability | 8 |
| Science of the Total Environment | 7 |
| Technological Forecasting and Social Change | 7 |
| Chinese Journal of Eco Agriculture | 6 |
| Frontiers in Energy Research | 6 |

When the geography of publications is analyzed there are many different studies from geographically different regions ranging from Europe to Asia. As it is seen in Figure 6 the most frequently studied countries are China, United States, United Kingdom and Germany.

Figure 6: Documents by Country or Territory (Source: Scopus)


Using VOSviewer software it is possible to see the co-authorship analysis. Co-authorship analysis investigates the interactions among scholars within a specific research domain. The findings of this analyses can justify and catalyze new research initiatives among scholars (Donthu, Kumar, Mukherjee, Pandey, \& Lim, 2021). Figure 7 shows the co-authorship analysis which indicates the interaction between authors highlighting the collaboration of academic studies and the contribution from various countries and institutions using the data taken from Web of Science.

Figure 7: Co-authorsip Analysis (Source: VOSviewer)


## 5. CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS

The concept of green transformation is relatively new and timely subject which is discussed in the literature to face sustainability challenges. It represents a fundamental shift in our approach towards sustainable development, aiming to reconcile economic growth with environmental control. Through the adoption of cleaner technologies, renewable energy sources, and more efficient resource management, the green transformation holds the promise of creating a greener, healthier, and more resilient future for our planet and future generations. Moreover, the green transformation offers significant opportunities for new technologies, environmental policies and job creation. By investing in clean technologies, sustainable infrastructure, and green industries, nations can foster a new era of green jobs, promoting both economic prosperity and environmental well-being. This transition presents an opportunity to reshape industries, reimagine urban spaces, and promote sustainable consumption and production patterns (Cheba et al., 2022).

Examining the above dimensions provides a comprehensive picture of green transformation, while also outlining the expected trajectory and key green transformation trends for regions and various businesses in the coming years. Starting from 2001 the number of publications in yearly basis are increasing gradually which also shows the increasing level of interest to the subject of "Green Transportation". Among the mostly studied subject areas Environmental Studies and Environmental Sciences takes the highest places.

The main limitation of the study is that the concept of green transformation has only been explored in the literature since 2001, making it a relatively new concept. Besides, for the future studies, green transformation can be further investigated by narrowing down to specific industries, regions, countries and subjects to delve deeper.

In conclusion, the green transformation is not just a desirable option; it is a necessity. It represents our best chance to mitigate climate change, protect biodiversity, and ensure the well-being of present and future generations. By embracing this transformative journey, we can create a world that is not only environmentally sustainable but also socially inclusive and economically prosperous. It is up to us to make the green transformation a reality, and in doing so, secure a brighter future for ourselves and the planet we call home.

## REFERENCES

Amundsen, H., \& Hermansen, E. A. (2021). Green transformation is a boundary object: An analysis of conceptualisation of transformation in Norwegian primary industries. Environment and Planning E: Nature and Space, 4(3), 864-885.

Berger, R. (2011). Green Growth, Green Profit: How Green Transformation Boosts Business. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
Cheba, K., Bąk, I., Szopik-Depczyńska, K., \& loppolo, G. (2022). Directions of green transformation of the European Union countries. Ecological Indicators, 136, 108601.

Death, C. (2015). Four discourses of the green economy in the global South. Third World Quarterly, 36(12), 2207-2224.
Donthu, N., Kumar, S., Mukherjee, D., Pandey, N., \& Lim, W. M. (2021). How to conduct a bibliometric analysis: An overview and guidelines. Journal of Business Research, 133, 285-296.

Efobi, U., Belmondo, T., Orkoh, E., Atata, S. N., Akinyemi, O., \& Beecroft, I. (2019). Environmental pollution policy of small businesses in Nigeria and Ghana: extent and impact. Environmental Science and Pollution Research, 26, 2882-2897.

Gu, J., Renwick, N., \& Xue, L. (2018). The BRICS and Africa's search for green growth, clean energy and sustainable development. Energy Policy, 120, 675-683.

Guo, Y., \& Yuan, Y. (2022). Assessing the energy resources policy agenda: Evidence from China's green express policy. Resources Policy, 79, 103037.

Hanif, S., Ahmed, A., \& Younas, N. (2023). Examining the impact of Environmental Management Accounting practices and Green Transformational Leadership on Corporate Environmental Performance: The mediating role of Green Process Innovation. Journal of Cleaner Production, 414, 137584.

Li, L., Zhu, B., Che, X., Sun, H., \& Tan, M. (2021). Examining effect of green transformational leadership and environmental regulation through emission reduction policy on energy-intensive industry's employee turnover intention in China. Sustainability, 13(12), 6530.

Luttropp, C., \& Karlsson, R. (2001). The conflict of contradictory environmental targets. Proceedings of 2nd International Symposium on Environmentally Conscious Design and Inverse Manufacturing (p. 43-48). Tokyo: IEEE.

Hojnik, J., Ruzzier, M., \& Manolova, T. S. (2018). Internationalization and economic performance: The mediating role of eco-innovation. Journal of Cleaner Production, 171, 1312-1323

Magyari, J., Zavarkó, M., \& Csedő, Z. (2022). Smart knowledge management driving green transformation: A comparative case study. Smart Energy, 7, 100085

Oyedokun, T., Jones, C., \& Dunse, N. (2015). The growth of the green office market in the UK. Journal of European Real Estate Research, 8(3), 267-284.

Pegels, A., \& Altenburg, T. (2020). Latecomer development in a "greening" world: Introduction to the Special Issue. World Development, 135, 105084.

Šūmakaris, P., Kovaitè, K., \& Korsakienè, R. (2023). An integrated approach to evaluating eco-innovation strategies from the perspective of strategic green transformation: A case of the Lithuanian furniture industry. Sustainability, 15(11), 8971.

Wang, Y. L., Wang, Q. F., Meng, C., Wang, Q. Q., \& Li, D. Y. (2012). Green Transformation Technology Suitability Research of Existing Office Building. Advanced Materials Research, 512, 2972-2975.

Zhao, X., Guo, Y., \& Feng, T. (2023). Towards green recovery: Natural resources utilization efficiency under the impact of environmental information disclosure. Resources Policy, 83, 103657.

# UNRAVELING THE GREAT RESIGNATION: A COMPREHENSIVE LITERATURE REVIEW ON THE WORKFORCE EXODUS PHENOMENON 

DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1832<br>RJBM- V.10-ISS.4-2023(2)-p.160-165

## Melike Artar ${ }^{1}$, Yavuz Selim Balcioglu ${ }^{2}$

${ }^{1}$ Gebze Technical University, School of Business, Kocaeli, Turkiye. artar@gtu.edu.tr , ORCID: 0000-0001-7138-2972
${ }^{2}$ Gebze Technical University, School of Business, Kocaeli, Turkiye.
ysbalcioglu@gtu.edu.tr, ORCID: 0000-0001-7714-748X

| Date Received: June 21, 2023 | Date Accepted: September 30, 2023 | open | Qaccess |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| (c) BY |  |  |  |

To cite this document
Artar, M., Balcioglu Y. S., (2023). Unraveling the great resignation: a comprehensive literature review on the workforce exodus henomenon. Research Journal of Business and Management (RJBM), 10(4), 160-165.
Permemant link to this document: http://doi.org/10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1832
Copyright: Published by PressAcademia and limited licenced re-use rights only.


#### Abstract

Purpose- The Great Resignation, a profound labor market shift following the COVID-19 pandemic, has seen employees globally re-evaluate their work-life priorities. This paper presents a comprehensive review of the literature on this phenomenon, aiming to consolidate existing knowledge, identifying research gaps, and offer insights to various stakeholders. Methodology- A systematic literature search was conducted using defined keywords such as "Great Resignation," "workforce trends," and "remote work" across multidisciplinary databases Web of Science and Scopus. Publications spanning 12 categories, including refereed articles, conference papers, and reviews, were reviewed to distill the essence of existing research Findings- The Great Resignation underlines a pivotal movement where work-life balance, health, safety, and job contentment surpass conventional job security. Contributing factors include blurred boundaries between professional and personal spheres due to remote work, health risks in the workplace, and a general rethinking of career choices following the pandemic. The increase in workloads and the stress of the global health crisis have accelerated burnout, making many seek healthier work environments. In addition, changes in cost of living and inflation have further fueled this trend. The phenomenon poses significant challenges for organizations, from talent retention to operational disruptions. Conclusion- Addressing the Great Resignation requires adaptive strategies from employers. The flexibility of work options, the prioritization of mental health, the availability of competitive compensation, and the maintenance of transparent communication emerge as essential. Governments, too, play a crucial role by ensuring policies that support worker rights, offer financial aid, and promote skill development. This review underscores the need for more empirical research to understand long-term impacts across various sectors and demographics and to develop effective retention strategies. The findings also provide a foundation for policymakers, business leaders, and academics to strategize and navigate the challenges and opportunities presented by the Great Resignation in the post-pandemic era. Future research directions include an in-depth exploration of sector-specific impacts, demographic variations, and long-term economic implications.


Keywords: Great resignation, workforce, Boolean operators, motivation, turnover ntention, millennials
JEL Codes: L22, M51, M54

## 1. INTRODUCTION

In recent times, the global labor market has witnessed an extraordinary phenomenon known as the "Great Resignation." Following the widespread impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, this unprecedented wave of voluntary job resignations has taken center stage in discussions among business leaders, policymakers, and academics alike. Coined by Anthony Klotz from Texas A\&M University (Hopkins and Figaro, 2021), the term "Great Resignation" encapsulates the collective decision of millions of employees across the globe to reassess their career trajectories, prioritize personal well-being, and redefine their notions of job satisfaction and work-life balance (Formica and Sfodera, 2022).

This massive workforce exodus not only left employers grappling with talent retention challenges, but has also reshaped traditional paradigms of employee motivation, job satisfaction, and workplace culture (Klotz and Bolino, 2016). The aftermath of the pandemic has acted as a catalyst, prompting employees to reconsider what they truly value in their professional lives ( Ng and Stanton, 2023). Amidst this backdrop, remote work and flexible work models have gained unprecedented attention, suggesting a potential correlation with the ongoing Great Resignation.

The societal and economic implications of this labor shift are far-reaching. As organizations face skill shortages and talent retention becomes increasingly complex, there is a pressing need for a deeper (Allman, 2021; Josifidis and Supic, 2023), more nuanced understanding of the factors driving this trend. Although the Great Resignation poses undeniable challenges, it simultaneously offers a unique opportunity for organizations to look at, innovate, and redefine the future of work.

Several scholars and researchers have explored this phenomenon (Tessema et al., 2022; Baranes and Brown, 2023), exploring its myriad facets from workforce trends to changing workplace policies. However, the scattered nature of existing research on the topic emphasizes the need for systematic consolidation of knowledge. Therefore, this literature review aims to bridge this gap by offering a comprehensive overview of the current discourse on the Great Resignation. By examining research from a variety of perspectives, we seek to present a cohesive picture that is beneficial to academics, business leaders, and policymakers alike. Through this endeavor, our goal is to foster a more profound understanding of the Great Resignation, its implications on the global labor market, and the strategic responses required to navigate the challenges and leverage the opportunities it presents.

Furthermore, the Great Resignation serves as a poignant reminder of the dynamic nature of the labor market and the intrinsic human need for purpose and fulfillment in professional pursuits. As society grapples with the aftereffects of a global health crisis, it is becoming evident that the workplace cannot remain isolated from larger societal changes. This phase underscores the interconnection between personal well-being, social events, and professional aspirations. Beyond immediate challenges, the Great Resignation is also a call to action for businesses and policymakers to proactively anticipate and respond to evolving workforce needs. This review of the literature, while aiming to encapsulate the current understanding of the phenomenon, also seeks to lay the foundations for future research and dialogue, emphasizing a proactive, rather than reactive, approach to changes in the labor market. It is our hope that this introspective journey into the Great Resignation will not only understanding but also inspire innovative solutions for a more resilient and harmonious future of work.

In the ensuing sections of this article, we will methodically unfold the layers of the Great Resignation, beginning with our systematic methodology that guided our literature search and analysis. Following this, we will delve into our findings, presenting the multifaceted reasons behind this workforce shift and its subsequent implications on the labor market. The discussion will further dissect the broader impacts and potential strategies that businesses, policymakers, and individuals can adopt in response. We will conclude by synthesizing the main takeaways, identifying gaps in current research, and suggesting future directions for both academia and industry. Through this structured flow, our aim is to provide readers with a holistic understanding of the Great Resignation, its implications, and the path forward in the evolving landscape of the global workforce.

The paper begins with an introduction to the "Great Resignation," setting the context of this phenomenon in the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic and highlighting its importance in the global labor market. The following section follows, outlining the systematic literature search strategy used to gather relevant data. We then present our findings, detailing how the pandemic has influenced work-life balance, remote work trends, workplace health risks, and employee resignations, as well as the resultant shift towards more flexible and meaningful work. The discussion section interprets these findings, exploring the broader implications for employees, employers, and policymakers, and underscoring the challenges and opportunities presented by this shift. The paper concludes by summarizing the key insights and highlighting the need for further empirical research to understand the long-term effects and devise effective strategies. Finally, it suggests practical implications for organizations and government policies and outlines future research directions to deepen our understanding of the Great Resignation and its extensive impact. This structured approach ensures a comprehensive and insightful analysis of the phenomenon.

## 2. METHODOLOGY

Literature search is a critical step in conducting a literature review, as it involves systematically identifying and collecting relevant research studies, articles, and publications that will inform the analysis and conclusions of the review. Here is an elaboration on the literature search process.

### 2.1. Define search terms

Begin by creating a list of search terms based on the main themes, concepts, and keywords related to our topic, such as "Great Resignation," "workforce trends," "employee motivation," "job satisfaction," "remote work," "flexible work arrangements," "organizational challenges," and "policy implications." These terms (Table 1) will help us to capture the various dimensions and aspects of the Great Resignation phenomenon. In addition to individual keywords, consider using phrases and combinations of terms to refine your search.

Table 1: List of Search Terms

| 1. Great Resignation | 7. Turnover | 13. Work-life balance | 19. Workplace Policies |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 2. Labor market trends | 8. Voluntary Resignations | 14.Organizational challenges | 20. Policy Implications |
| 3. Workforce Trends | 9. Employee retention | 15. Skill shortages | 21. Employee Engagement |
| 4. Motivation of employees | 10. Talent Management | 16.Generational Differences | 22. Employee burnout |
| 5. Job satisfaction | 11. Remote Work | 17. Millennials | 23.Post-pandemic workplace |
| 6. Job dissatisfaction | 12.Flexible Work Arrangements | 18. Generation Z | 24.COVID-19 impact |

Using these terms, we created search queries to explore the literature. Employ Boolean operators (AND, OR, NOT) to combine or exclude keywords, and use quotation marks to search for exact phrases. Likewise, we used "employee motivation" OR "job satisfaction" to broaden our search to include articles that explore either concept in relation to the Great Resignation.

### 2.2. Select Databases

The Web of Science, a multidisciplinary database, offers an extensive collection of research articles from various fields, including social sciences, economics, and management. This database is particularly helpful for tracking citation patterns and identifying highly influential articles in the field of study.

Scopus, another multidisciplinary database, provides a large volume of peer-reviewed articles and conference papers from diverse subject areas. Its advanced search and citation analysis features make it a valuable resource to identify relevant literature and understand the research landscape surrounding the Great Resignation phenomenon.

Using both Web of Science and Scopus for our literature search, our goal is to capture a broad range of research articles related to the Great Resignation, encompassing various aspects such as workforce trends, employee motivation, remote work, and policy implications. These databases will facilitate the identification of relevant and high-quality literature to inform our comprehensive review on the phenomenon of great resignation.

### 2.3. Develop search strategies

Combine your search terms using Boolean operators (AND, OR, NOT) to refine your search and find the most relevant literature. For example, you might search for "Great Resignation AND Employee Motivation" or "workforce trends OR job satisfaction."

### 2.4. Apply Filters

Use database filters to narrow down your search results based on criteria such as publication date (Table 2), language, document type (e.g., journal articles, conference papers, books) and subject areas. This can help you focus on the most relevant and recent literature.

Table 2: Scope Review Categories

| Article | Editorial Material | Early Access | Review Article |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Book Chapters | Proceeding Paper | Book Review | Meeting Abstract |
| Letter | Book | Discussion | Data Paper |

## 3. FINDINGS

The pandemic has caused many people to reassess their work-life balance. Remote work has blurred the lines between personal and professional life, leading many to seek jobs that offer a better balance. The risk of exposure to COVID-19 on the workplace has led many employees (Baker et al., 2020), particularly those in customer-facing roles, to resign. This is especially true for those with underlying health conditions or those who live with vulnerable individuals. Many employees have come to appreciate the flexibility of remote work and are not willing to return to a traditional office environment. Companies that insist on a full return to the office may see higher resignation rates (Zalot, 2023). The pandemic has given people time to reflect on their career choices. Some have decided to pursue different career paths, go back to school, or start their own businesses. Increased workload during the pandemic, coupled with the stress of living through a global health crisis, has led to widespread burnout, causing many to leave their jobs in search of a healthier work environment (Galanti et al., 2021). With the increase in cost of living and inflation, many workers are looking for jobs that offer higher pay or better benefits. Companies that do not adjust their compensation packages to reflect these changes may see higher turnover rates. (Allman, 2021). With many schools and childcare facilities closed or operating at reduced capacity during the pandemic, working parents have struggled to balance their professional responsibilities with childcare. This has led some parents to completely leave the workforce. Some people are seeking more meaningful or fulfilling work (Formica and Sfodera, 2022). The pandemic has led many to reassess their values and priorities, leading them to seek roles that align more closely with their personal interests and passions. The number of research papers for scope review is shown in Table 3.

Organizations are facing the challenge of retaining their employees midst the Great Resignation (Liu-Lastres, Wen and Huang 2022). They must rethink their strategies and policies to ensure that they are meeting the changing needs and expectations of their workforce. With many employees resigning, organizations are struggling to fill vacant positions. This has increased the competition for talent, making it more difficult for organizations to find qualified candidates. High turnover rates can disrupt business operations and negatively impact productivity (Serenko, 2022). Organizations must find ways to ensure continuity despite frequent changes in personnel. The healthcare sector has been particularly affected, with many healthcare workers resigning due to burnout and the high stress environment caused by the pandemic (Zagorsky, 2024). Schools and universities are also facing high resignation rates, which impact the quality of education and increase the workload of the remaining staff. These sectors, which often require in-person work, have seen a significant number of resignations due to health concerns and the desire for remote work.

Table 3: The number of Research Papers for Scope Review

| Topic | Article | Editorial <br> Material | Early Access | Review <br> Article | Book Chapters | Proceeding Paper | Book Review | Meeting Abstract | Letter | Book | Discussion | Data <br> Paper |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Great Resignation | 36 | 21 | 12 | 6 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Labour market trends | 62 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 19 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Workforce trends | 104 | 14 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 9 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Employee <br> Motivation | 783 | 7 | 18 | 22 | 13 | 219 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Job satisfaction | 34749 | 297 | 1001 | 1802 | 623 | 2639 | 0 | 531 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Job dissatisfaction | 1199 | 13 | 21 | 50 | 0 | 62 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Turnover | 153188 | 1429 | 1623 | 11800 | 0 | 9857 | 0 | 0 | 539 | 0 | 0 | 34 |
| Voluntary <br> Resignations | 14 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Employee retention | 797 | 0 | 27 | 25 | 16 | 116 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Talent <br> Management | 1948 | 75 | 70 | 114 | 302 | 436 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Remote work | 1105 | 39 | 109 | 50 | 18 | 220 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Flexible Work <br> Arrangements | 403 | 0 | 23 | 18 | 11 | 37 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Work-Life Balance | 5496 | 272 | 0 | 281 | 373 | 414 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Organisational challenges | 217 | 0 | 7 | 23 | 9 | 50 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Skill shortages | 233 | 14 | 0 | 12 | 8 | 35 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Generational Differences | 1891 | 48 | 54 | 70 | 80 | 134 | 0 | 37 | 7 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Millennials | 2711 | 132 | 129 | 0 | 250 | 421 | 89 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Generation Z | 1119 | 28 | 101 | 0 | 34 | 354 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Workplace policies | 436 | 11 | 19 | 31 | 5 | 31 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Policy implications | 27215 | 556 | 888 | 0 | 1119 | 1945 | 251 | 204 | 50 | 0 | 0 | 9 |
| Employee engagement | 2700 | 55 | 168 | 118 | 176 | 280 | 17 | 31 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Employee burnout | 186 | 0 | 5 | 8 | 4 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Post-pandemic workplace | 8 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

## 4. DISCUSSION

The Great Resignation represents a significant shift in the labor market, with employees prioritizing work-life balance, health and safety, and job satisfaction over traditional job security. This shift has been driven by a combination of pandemic-related factors, including the transition to remote work, increased stress and burnout, and a reevaluation of personal and professional priorities.

Great resignation offers employees the opportunity to seek better working conditions, higher pay, and more fulfilling roles. However, it also presents challenges, such as the uncertainty of job hunting during a pandemic and the potential for increased job competition. Employers are faced with the challenge of retaining their current employees and attracting new ones in a competitive job market (Sull et al., 2022). They may need to re-assess their workplace policies and offer more flexible work arrangements, competitive compensation packages, and a supportive work environment. Governments play a crucial role in supporting workers and employers during this time (Jiskrova, 2022). This could involve implementing policies that protect workers' rights, providing financial support to businesses, and investing in training and education to help workers transition to new roles or industries.

Employers can offer flexible work arrangements, such as remote work or flexible hours, to accommodate employees' needs and preferences (Tessema et al., 2022; Gewin, 2022). Prioritizing employee well-being, through initiatives such as mental health support, stress management programs, and a healthy work environment, can help reduce burnout and improve job satisfaction. Offering competitive compensation packages, including fair wages, comprehensive benefits, and opportunities for growth and development, can attract and retain talent (Zalot, 2023; Fuller and Kerr, 2022; Rymsha, 2023). Employers must maintain open and transparent communication with their employees, address their concerns, and providing clear information about the organization's plans and policies. Governments can provide support through policies that protect workers' rights, provide financial support to businesses, and invest in training and education to help workers transition to new roles or industries.

## 5. CONCLUSION

The phenomenon of great resignation represents a major shift in workforce trends, with profound implications for organizations, employees, and labor market policies. This comprehensive review of the literature has explored the multifaceted nature of the Great Resignation, shedding light on its drivers, consequences, and potential strategies for navigating this new terrain. The literature revealed that factors such as job satisfaction, employee motivation, and the increasing demand for remote and flexible work arrangements are central to understanding the Great Resignation (Sull et al., 2022). These findings underscore the need for organizations to adapt their workplace policies and practices to meet changing employee expectations and retain talent in this era of great resignation.

In the context of the COVID-19 pandemic, the Great Resignation has also highlighted the importance of work-life balance and mental well-being in employment decisions, as reflected in the literature. As such, organizations and policy makers must prioritize these aspects to address the challenges posed by the Great Resignation and to build a more resilient and sustainable labor market. Additionally, the review identified significant literature gaps, indicating the need for more research. Specifically, more empirical studies are needed to investigate the long-term impacts of the Great Resignation on different industries, demographic groups, and economies. Future research should also explore the effectiveness of various strategies to manage the Great Resignation and promote employee retention and engagement.

In conclusion, this comprehensive review of the literature has provided a holistic understanding of the phenomenon of great resignation. By consolidating existing knowledge and identifying areas for future research, this review contributes to academic discourse and offers valuable information for practitioners and policy makers navigating the Great Resignation. As we continue to grapple with this labor market phenomenon, the insights derived from this literature review offer a roadmap for navigating the challenges and opportunities of the Great Resignation in the post-pandemic world.

### 5.1. Implications \& Future Research

Organizations may need to review their workplace policies to include more flexible work arrangements, better compensation packages, and improved health and safety measures. Governments may need to consider policies that support workers, such as increased minimum wages, better unemployment benefits, and support for childcare.

More research is needed to understand the specific causes of the Great Resignation and how they vary across different sectors and demographics. Researchers should investigate the long-term impacts of this phenomenon on individuals, organizations, and the economy as a whole. Future research should also focus on identifying effective strategies for organizations to retain their employees and navigate the challenges posed by the Great Resignation.

## REFERENCES

Allman, K. (2021). Career matters: The great resignation that sweeping workplaces around the world. Law Society Journal, 81, 46-47.
Baranes, A. I., \& Brown, L. (2023). Labor relations in a Post-COVID economy: the great resignation through the lens of institutional adjustment. Journal of Economic Issues, 57(2), 567-574.

Baker, M. G., Peckham, T. K., \& Seixas, N. S. (2020). Estimating the burden of United States workers exposed to infection or disease: a key factor in containing risk of COVID-19 infection. PloS one, 15(4), 153-169.

Galanti, T., Guidetti, G., Mazzei, E., Zappalà, S., \& Toscano, F. (2021). Work from home during the COVID-19 outbreak: The impact on employees' remote work productivity, engagement, and stress. Journal of occupational and environmental medicine, 63(7), 426-441.

Gewin, V. (2022). Has the'great resignation'hit academia?. Nature, 211-213. https://doi.org/10.1038/d41586-022-01512-6.
Formica, S., \& Sfodera, F. (2022). The great resignation and quiet quitting paradigm shifts: an overview of current situation and future research directions. Journal of Hospitality Marketing \& Management, 31(8), 899-907.

Fuller, J., \& Kerr, W. (2022). The great resignation didn't start with the pandemic. Harvard Business Review, 23. 389-403.
Hopkins, J. C., \& Figaro, K. A. (2021). The great resignation: an argument for hybrid leadership. International Journal of Business and Management Research, 9(4), 393-400. https://doi.org/10.37391/IJBMR. 090402.

J Jiskrova, G. K. (2022). Impact of COVID-19 pandemic on the workforce: from psychological distress to the Great Resignation. J Epidemiol Community Health, 76(6), 525-526. http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/jech-2022-218826

Josifidis, K., \& Supic, N. (2023). Is there a trade-off between global inflation and the great resignation in the United States? Journal of Economic Issues, 57(2), 499-506. https://doi.org/10.1080/00213624.2023.2201793

Klotz, A. C., \& Bolino, M. C. (2016). Saying goodbye: The nature, causes, and consequences of employee resignation styles. Journal of Applied Psychology, 101(10), 1386. https://doi.org/10.1037/apl0000135.

Liu-Lastres, B., Wen, H., \& Huang, W. J. (2023). A reflection on the great resignation in the hospitality and tourism industry. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 35(1), 235-249. https://10.1108/IJCHM-05-2022-0551.

Ng, E., \& Stanton, P. (2023). The great resignation: managing people in a post COVID-19 pandemic world. Personnel Review, 52(2), 401-407. https://10.1108/PR-03-2023-914.

Rymsha, C. (2023). The Power of the Stay Interview After the Great Resignation. SAGE Publications: SAGE Business Cases Originals. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781529620252

Serenko, A. (2022). The great resignation: the great knowledge exodus or the onset of the great knowledge revolution? Journal of Knowledge Management, 27(4), 1042-1055.

Sull, D., Sull, C., \& Zweig, B. (2022). Toxic culture is driving the great resignation. MIT Sloan Management Review, 63(2), 1-9.
Tessema, M. T., Tesfom, G., Faircloth, M. A., Tesfagiorgis, M., \& Teckle, P. (2022). The "great resignation": Causes, consequences, and creative HR management strategies. Journal of Human Resource and Sustainability Studies, 10(1), 161-178.

Zagorsky, J. L. (2024). How Did the Great Resignation Impact Government Jobs?. In Pivoting Government through Digital Transformation (pp. 57-71). Auerbach Publications. https://doi.org/10.1201/9781003369783

Zalot, M. C. (2023). Spillover Stress From "The Great Resignation" in the United States: Broken Cross-Departmental Dependencies. In Perspectives on Workplace Communication and Well-Being in Hybrid Work Environments (pp. 96-113). IGI Global. https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-6684-7353-5.ch007

# THE INFLUENCE OF PERCEIVED ORGANISATION SUPPORT ON EMPLOYEES' ENGAGEMENT IN TANZANIA: A CASE OF SMES 

DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1833
RJBM- V.10-ISS.4-2023(3)-p.166-173

Judith J. Msangi
Institute of Social Work, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania
juddie884@yahoo.com , ORCID: 0009-0005-9750-3118

| Date Received: September 17, 2023 | Date Accepted: November 29, 2023 | open ${ }^{\text {O/ access }}$ | (cc) BY |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

## To cite this document

Msangi, J., (2023). The influence of perceived organisation support on employees'engagement in Tanzania: a case of SMEs. Research Journal of Business and Management (RJBM), 10(4), 166-173.
Permanent link to this document: http://doi.org/10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1833
Copyright: Published by PressAcademia and limited licensed re-use rights only.

## ABSTRACT

Purpose- For the organization to strive in today's competitive environment, managers should provide a working environment that is conducive and supportive to its members/employees. Human beings like to be recognized, valued, and taken care of while they are performing their duties. The study examines the influence of perceived organisation support on employees' engagement in small and medium enterprises in Tanzania
Methodology- The study is guided by the Social Exchange Theory which explains that the amount of care and support given to the employees is the same amount of commitment they will give back to the organisation and hence engagement. The study is positivist where cross-sectional design was used to study the relationship between perceived organisation support and employees' engagement in SMEs, and it was done in three regions which are Dar es Salaam, Morogoro and Manyara. The study used stratified sampling and structural equation modelling was used to analyze data.
Findings- The findings showed that organisation support has a significant influence on employees' engagement (both job and organisation engagement).
Conclusion- The study recommends that SMEs should support employees by matching their interests with those of the SMEs. When these interests match, is where the employees feel valued and respected and perceive that the organisation cares about their well-being.

Keywords: Perceived organisation support, employees' engagement, SME, engagement, Social Exchange Theory
JEL Codes: D11, E21, M31

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Organisations are striving to get the efforts of their employees who are well organized and can devote their time to work with them. It is well known that in any organisation there are different resources like monetary and non-monetary resources (like time, people, tools, etc.) These resources if they are effectively utilized make the organisation achieve its competitive advantage. Work is essentially related to employees' quality of life, fulfilment of one's work to the total overall satisfaction which is much more extended to the normal life beyond the workplace (Kumar, 2019; Xiang, et al., 2017). Working is more than making people earn a living rather people will find a true meaning in life and a sense of belonging (Khajuria, et al. 2022; Musenze, et al., 2021).

In today's world, the operations of any organisation are faced with different challenges which are coming from internal and external environments. These challenges may be political, economic, social, technological, environmental, and legal (Gadi, et al. 2020). To tackle these challenges, the organisation needs to have a well-engaged workforce which will enable the organisation to perform at a higher level (Chen, et al, 2020). This can be achieved if employees will get full support from the organisation (Wan, \& Saidin, 2018; Adeoye \& Elegunde, 2012).

Perceived Organizational Support (POS) is related to the increasing company commitment, positive attitudes towards work such as job involvement, work and the desire to stay in the organisation, and reduce absenteeism behavior which increases company output (Shuck, 2020; Ghazali, et al., 2018). The greater the level of perceived organizational support, the greater the level of employee engagement, (job and organisation); equally, the lower the level of perceived organizational support,
the lower the level of employee engagement (Imran, et al., 2020; Saks, 2019). Work engagement is defined as a condition in which a person feels satisfied and has positive thoughts about their work which is characterized by high enthusiasm (vigor), dedication and focus/appreciation (absorption) in doing work (Isa, et al., 2020; Schaufeli \& Bakker, 2004). Also, it is seen as the employee's perception of the extent to which he feels that the organization appreciates his work contribution and cares for his welfare (Wang, et al., 2020).

There are many factors that influence organisation engagement, one of which is perceived organizational support (Stefanidis, \& Strogilos, 2020; Tan, et al., 2020). Support from the organization is needed by employees as employees feel that they are valued by the organisation which in turn raises the level of commitment and hence influences employees' engagement at the workplace. Amir and Mangundjaya (2021) and Eisenberger et al. (2016) define perceived organizational support as an overall employee belief about the extent to which organizations value their contribution and care about their well-being.

The support which employees need is an appreciation for their performance whether it's financial or non-financial and also career advancement (Hameduddin, \& Fernandez, 2019; Al-dalahmeh, et al. 2018). This will affect the positive thinking of employees in their minds that the organisation is supporting them so they will try to give back to the organisation by engaging themselves. In other words, perceived organizational support expresses the employees' attitudes that lead to a good relationship between employees and the organization (William, et al. 2021). Organizational support explains how employees form a general insight concerning the extent to which the organization values their contributions and cares about their welfare (Karim, et al. 2019; Eisenberger \& Stinglhamber, 2011).

Employees who create a friendly relationship with the organisation are those who will likely receive support and increase performance. This is the norm that the employee creates as a manner of paying back to the organisation and hence engagement (Gusti \& Gede 2021). There is limited research on the role of organisation support and employees' engagement in small and medium-sized organisations. The majority of studies that have been conducted focus on large organisations. Employees' engagement is categorized into two groups, namely organisation and job engagement (Saks, 2006; Welch, 2011). With this classification of employee engagement, it is not likely that organisation support to have the same influence on job and organisation engagement. This has not been considered by other studies. With this research gap, it was important to conduct a study on the influence of organisation support on employees' engagement in small and medium-sized organisations. This study is going to bridge the gap which other researcher did not address the support employees needed to foster the engagement.

## 2. LITERATURE REVIEW

Perceived Organisation Support leads to employees' engagement in an organisation (Shuck, 2020; Hameduddin, \& Fernandez, 2019; Kumar, 2019; Knight, 2013). Organizations have a responsibility to ensure that employees' welfare is protected. Once employees perceive that the organisation cares about them and obtain the required support, they are likely to be more engaged in the organisation. Knight (2013) continues that when employees feel as if an organisation is monitoring or viewing the employee, the employee usually sees this as support and subsequently will become more engaged at work. This is supported by Dawley et al. (2010) and Meintjes, et al. (2018) that POS assures the employee that the organisation stands behind them as they perform their job and handle stressful conditions.

Eisenberger et al. (2002) and Lee, et al. 2019) proclaim that employees believe that organisations have an employee orientation that encompasses both recognition of their contribution and concern for their welfare. Therefore, there is a positive relationship between perceived organisation support and employees' engagement (Pati \& Kumar, 2010; Zacher \& Winter, 2011; Biswas \& Bhatnagar, 2013; Chass et al., 2018).

The organisation needs to take care of and support its employees to achieve its goals. According to Rhoades et al. (2001), POS creates an obligation on the part of employees to care about the organisation's welfare and to help the organisation reach its objectives. It has been therefore generally argued that an open and supportive environment is important for employees to feel that they are secure at the workplace and therefore engage themselves in performing their responsibilities (Wan, et al., 2018; Ghosh, et al., 2016).
Saks (2006) also agrees that perceived organisational support influences an employees' perception and the belief that enables them to fulfil their roles and engage themselves with the organizational objectives. Therefore, there is a significant relationship between perceived organization support and employees' engagement (Eisenberger et al., 2001; May et al., 2004; Pati and Kumar, 2010; Zacher and Winter, 2011; Biswas and Bhatnagar, 2013).

Moreover, employees feel more comfortable if the organization cares about their welfare and hence they become committed to the organisation's goals. If the organisation provides support to the employees, they tend to be more
engaged. This is supported by Alvi et al. (2014) who argue that organisation support is an important predictor of employee engagement. It was therefore hypothesized that;
$H_{1 a}$ :The organisation support positively influences job engagement.
$H_{1 b}$ :The organisation support positively influences organisation engagement.

### 2.1. Theoretical Review

This study drew on the Social Exchange Theory (SET) as an important theory that explains the relationship between perceived organisation support and employees' engagement. The theory suggests that there is a reciprocal exchange between variables (employees and organisation). Employees assume that their organizations provide them with intangible and tangible support, a norm of reciprocity that creates a feeling of obligation among employees (Gusti \& Gede 2021). A norm recommends that employees with high POS pay off their organizations in the form of engaging themselves in their work. This exchange is whether positive or negative, so when employees perceive it positively, is where they will reciprocate with favourable behavior and attitude and hence engagement (Chernyak-Hai, \& Rabenu, 2018). Human beings always choose the behavior which will maximize profit and the possibility of meeting their needs and expectations, so if the organisation is providing such a supporting relationship is where the employee will give back to the organisation by engaging themselves.

### 2.2. Conceptual Framework

Organisation support makes an employee feel more comfortable and it reduces turnover to the employees. If employees are getting enough support from the management, they tend to give back to the organisation which enhances their engagement. Below is the relationship between organisation support and employee's engagement.
Figure 1: Conceptual Framework

## Organisation Support

## Employees' engagement



### 2.3. Research Methodology

This study adopted the positivism paradigm, and it applied a cross-sectional design to investigate the relationship between organisation support and employees' engagement in SMEs. The unit of inquiry was employees from small and medium enterprises who were considered in two sub-groups (small and medium enterprises). The study was conducted in three (3) regions, namely Dar es Salaam, Manyara and Morogoro with a sample of 483 SMEs and they were involved in data analysis by using Structural Equation Modelling (SEM) to explain the relationship between organisation support and employee's engagement. The validity and reliability test was also examined.

## 3. FINDINGS

### 3.1. The Demographic Characteristics of the Respondents

The study involved respondents with different age categories, marital status, level of education, and different experiences. To understand the engagement of employees, experience matters a lot, as the long-serving employees in the organisation the more it could be easier to determine his/her engagement. In terms of service experience, the majority of the respondents, $44.5 \%$ had an experience of 2 to 4 years followed by the respondents with an experience of $5-9$ years which was $37.9 \%$. More data on age categories, marital status, level of education, and different experiences are shown in Table 1 below.

Table 1: The Demographic Characteristics of the Respondents

| S/No. | Details | Category | Frequency | Percent |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. | Sex | Male | 279 | 57.8 |
|  |  | Female | 204 | 42.2 |
|  |  | Total | 483 | 100 |
| 2 | Age | 20-25 | 90 | 18.6 |
|  |  | 26-45 | 267 | 55.3 |
|  |  | 46-55 | 110 | 22.8 |
|  |  | 56-60 | 13 | 2.7 |
|  |  | Above 60 | 3 | 0.6 |
|  |  | Total | 483 | 100 |
| 3 | Marital Status | Single | 137 | 28.4 |
|  |  | Married | 304 | 62.9 |
|  |  | Divorced | 17 | 3.5 |
|  |  | Widow/ widower | 25 | 5.2 |
|  |  | Total | 483 | 100 |
| 4 | Educational Level | Postgraduate qualification | 13 | 2.7 |
|  |  | Degree/Advanced Diploma | 22 | 4.6 |
|  |  | Ordinary Diploma | 31 | 6.4 |
|  |  | Certificate | 72 | 14.9 |
|  |  | Vocational/Technical Training | 60 | 12.4 |
|  |  | "A" Level Education | 35 | 7.2 |
|  |  | "O" Level Education | 179 | 37.1 |
|  |  | Primary School | 67 | 13.9 |
|  |  | No formal schooling | 4 | 0.8 |
|  |  | Total | 483 | 100 |
| 5 | Business Experience (in years) | Less than a year | 19 | 3.9 |
|  |  | 2-4 | 215 | 44.5 |
|  |  | 5-8 | 183 | 37.9 |
|  |  | 9 years and above | 66 | 13.7 |
|  |  | Total | 483 | 100 |

### 3.2. Enterprises' Characteristics

Ownership structure, establishment, business location, types of activities, and number of employees are variables used to determine the characteristics of an enterprise. Most of the businesses were sole proprietorships (73.1\%), compared to partnerships (13.5\%) and cooperatives (4.3\%). In terms of business location, the majority of enterprises were from Dar es Salaam ( $46.8 \%$ ) and Morogoro (38.9\%). Trade, service and manufacturing are what categorizes the enterprises. The majority of enterprises (67.9\%) dealt with trade, services (24.6\%) and manufacturing (7.5\%). Furthermore, the findings reveal that the majority of enterprises, 307 (63.6\%) had employed between 5 and 49 people while $36.4 \%$ employed between 50 to 99 people.

### 3.3. Reliability

Cronbach Alpha was used to assess internal consistency from organisation support in which the internal consistency was assured as proposed by Nunnally (1997). The Cronbach alpha coefficient should be at least 0.7 , and the internal consistency coefficients on job and organisation engagement were above 0.7 which was in line with what was suggested to be at least 0.7 .

### 3.4. Confirmatory Factor Analysis

The model has eight (8) items coded from Orgsup1 to Orgsup8. Orgsup1 = Concern of the supervisor on employees' wellbeing; Orgsup2 = The supervisor cares about employees' goals, values and opinions; Orgsup3 = Availability of the organization to help an employee in case of any problem; Orgsup4 = Availability of support to perform their jobs. In addition, Orgsup5 = Availability of employees' opportunities to achieve their objectives; Orgsup6 = Organization vision and value of the job; Orgsup7 = Availability of facilities to do the job right; Orgsup8 = Working as a team.

Initially, the model produced model fit indices which indicated that the model did not fit the data well. Then, the model was modified by eliminating Orgsup5, Orgsup6, Orgsup7 and Orgsup8. Hence, the modified model produced indices that showed the fitness of the model to data. The produced indices were as follows: CMNIN/df $=4.974 ; \mathrm{GFI}=0.939$; AGFI $=$ $0.902 ; \mathrm{CFI}=0.939 ; \mathrm{RMSEA}=0.073$.

### 3.5. Descriptive Statistics

The following are the descriptive results of the variable, using percentages and mean scores. According to Oxford and Burry Stock (1995), the Mean Score of 1.0 to 2.4 indicates a low application, 2.5 to 3.4 (Medium) and 3.5 to 5.0 (High) assuming the five (5.0) points Likert scale.

Table 2: Perceived Organizational Support

| S/N | Variable/Item | Mean | Remarks |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Organisational Support |  |  |
| 3.0 | My organization really cares about my well-being | 3.48 | Medium |
| 3.1 | My organization strongly considers my goals and values | 3.53 | High |
| 3.2 | My organization considers employees' goals | 3.52 | High |
| 3.3 | My organization cares about my opinions | 3.99 | High |
| 3.4 | My organization is willing to help me if I need a special favor. | 4.03 | High |
| 3.5 | Help is available from my organization when I have a problem | 3.97 | High |
| 3.6 | My organization would forgive an honest mistake on my part. | 4.01 | High |
| 3.7 | If given the opportunity, my organization would take advantage of me | 3.84 | High |

### 3.6. Organisational Support and Employees' Engagement

The study had two hypotheses i.e. $\mathrm{H}_{1 a}$ and $\mathrm{H}_{1 \mathrm{~b}}$. $\mathrm{H}_{1 \mathrm{a}}$ stated that organizational support positively influences job engagement, while $\mathrm{H}_{1 b}$ stated that organizational support positively influences organizational engagement.

The findings revealed that organizational support had a significant positive influence on job engagement, hence $H_{1 a}$ was supported. The standardized regression weight was 0.694 and significant at 0.001 . This indicated that the more the organisation supports its employees, the more the employees become engaged in their jobs. Issues like consideration of the organisation on employees' goals, values and opinions, help from the organisation in case of any problem, and forgiveness for honest mistakes just to mention a few of them, enhanced employees' engagement in their jobs.
The results also revealed that organizational support had a significant positive influence on organizational engagement, hence $H_{1 b}$ was supported. The standardized regression weight was 0.816 and significant at 0.001 . This means that the more an organization supports its employees, the more it engages its employees in the organisation. In addition to the organizational support issues previously mentioned, willingness to care about employees' well-being, and showing concern for supporting employees to perform their responsibilities significantly contributed to the organizational engagement by employees. Generally, the hypotheses were supported because organizational support was found to have a significant influence on both job and organizational engagement.

Figure 1: Model for Employees' Organisation Support and Employees' Engagement


## 4. DISCUSSIONS

The study examined the influence of organizational support on employees' engagement. Hence the study had the hypotheses which stated that organizational support positively influences Employees' engagement, namely job engagement and organizational engagement.

The descriptive results showed that the majority of respondents agreed to have been given special consideration when needed. Furthermore, it was revealed that the organisation forgave their employees when they made honest mistakes meanwhile it cared about their opinions. More important, the majority accepted to receive help from the organisation when needed. This demonstrated that SMEs were adequately providing support to their employees. Its influence on job engagement and organisation engagement is demonstrated by the inferential results.

The study had the hypotheses stated that organizational support had a significant positive influence on job engagement and organizational engagement. The inferential results revealed that organizational support had a significant positive influence on both job engagement and organisation engagement. The significant influence of organizational support on employees' engagement is also supported by the descriptive results. This demonstrated the SME's efforts towards supporting their employees to the extent that they felt to be engaged in both job and organisation. Furthermore, the SMEs have less focus on division of labour and specialization due to their size that promotes a close relationship among employees and, between employees and the owner-manager. The close working relationship provides a better opportunity for the SMEs to support their employees and hence promote employees' engagement.

The findings are supported by several studies on employees' engagement and organizational support. These studies include Pati and Kumar (2010), Zacher and Winter (2011), and Biswas and Bhatnagar (2013). However, these studies focused on the relationship between Employees' engagement and organizational support. They did not focus on the influence of organisational support on job engagement and organizational engagement individually. In addition, the findings of this study are supported by Knight (2013) and Rhoades, et al. (2001). They both argue that organisational support promotes organizational engagement.

## 5. CONCLUSION

This study concludes that organisational support has a significant influence on employees' engagement that including job engagement and organisational engagement. Specifically, willingness to give special consideration when needed, the
forgiveness of honest mistakes, care of employees' opinions and providing help to an employee when needed promote employee engagement both job and organisational engagement. In this case, organisational support is the HRM practices that promote the willingness of employees to exert his/her maximum efforts in performing his/her responsibilities. It also influences an employee to identify herself with the organisation and feel like one of the family members of the organization.

### 5.1. Recommendations

The findings revealed that organizational support had a significant positive influence on job and organization engagement. This implies that when employees perceive that SMEs support them, they engage themselves in the organization. This means that employees, who feel that are respected, valued, cared and involved in giving their opinions, engage themselves with the SMEs. Hence the study suggests the following; SMEs owners and managers should systematically match the employees' interests and organizational interests. However, the interests of SMEs should be superior to the interests of employees. Moreover, it is important to treat employees as partners and support them to achieve the organization's objectives.

## REFERENCES

Al-dalahmeh, M., Masa'deh, R., Khalaf, R.K., \& Obeidat, B. Y. (2018). The effect of employee engagement on organizational performance via the mediating role of job satisfaction: the case of IT employees in Jordanian banking sector. Modern Applied Science, 12(6), 17-43.

Chen, T., Hao, S., Ding, K., Feng, X., Li, G., \& Liang, X. (2020). The impact of organizational support on employee performance. Employee Relatations International Journal., 42, 166-179.

Chernyak-Hai, L., \& Rabenu, E. (2018). The new era workplace relationships: is social exchange theory still relevant? Industrial and Organizational Psychology, 11(3), 456-481.

Gadi, P.D. \& Hung-Kee, D. M. (2020). Work engagement and turnover intention: the moderating role of perceived supervisor support and perceived organizational support. International Journal of Advance Science and Technology, 29, 1064-1073.

Ghazali, H., Nashuki, N.M., \& Othman, M. (2018). The influence of perceived organizational support (pos), perceived supervisory support (PSS) and organizational commitment (OC) towards intention to leave or intention to stay: A case of casual dining restaurants in Klang Valley, Malaysia. International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences, 8(9), 1884-1902.

Ghosh P., Rai A., \& Singh, A. (2016). Support at work to fuel engagement: A study of employees of Indian banking sector. Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research, 5(2), 1-10.

Gusti N.G., \& Gede, R. (2021). The effect of perceived organizational support on employee engagement and employee performance. Science, Engineering and Social Science Series,5(3), 260-264.

Hameduddin, T. \& Fernandez, S. (2019). Employee engagement as administrative reform: testing the efficacy of the OPM's employee engagement initiative. Public Administration Review, 79(3), 355-369.

Imran, M. Y., Elahi, N. S., Abid, G., Ashfaq, F. \& Ilyas, S. (2020). Impact of perceived organizational support on work engagement: mediating mechanism of thriving and flourishing. Journal of Open Innovation: Technology, Market and Complexity, 82(6), 1-18.

Isa, A.B., \& Ibrahim, H.B. (2020). The mediating effect of perceived organizational support between talent development and employee engagement at Malaysian glcs. International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences, 10(10), 505-517.

Karim D. N., Baset M. A., \& Rahman M. M. (2019). The effect of perceived organizational support on intention to stay: The mediating role of job involvement. The Jahangirnagar Journal of Business Studies, 8(1), 21-30.

Khajuria, G., \& Khan, N. (2022). Perceived organisational support and employee engagement: A literature review. Journal of Positive School Psychology, 6(3), 1366-1384.

Kumar K. (2019). The effects of perceived organizational support (POS) and perceived organizational justice (POJ) on employee engagement (EE) of Indian employee in information technology. International Journal of Recent Technology and Engineering, 8(IC2), 209-215.

Lee, M.C., Idris, M.A. \& Tuckey, M. (2019). Supervisory coaching and performance feedback as mediators of the relationships between leadership styles, work engagement, and turnover intention. Human Resource Development International, 22(3), 257-282.

Musenze, I. A., Mayende, T. S., Wampande, A. J., Kasango, J., \& Emojong, O. R. (2021). Mechanism between perceived organizational support and work engagement: explanatory role of self-efficacy. Journal of Economic and Administrative Sciences, 37(4), 471-495.

Saks, A.M. (2019). Antecedents and consequences of employee engagement revisited. Journal of Organizational Effectiveness: People and Performance, 6(1), 19-38.

Saks, A. M. (2006). Antecedents and consequences of employee engagement. Journal of managerial psychology, 21(7), 600-619.

Shuck, B. (2020). Employee Engagement: A Research Overview, Routledge, Abingdon.
Stefanidis, A., \& Strogilos, V. (2020). Perceived organizational support and work engagement of employees with children with disabilities. Personnel Review, 50(1), 186-206.

Tan, L., Wang, Y., Qian, W., \& Lu, H. (2020). Leader humor and employee job crafting: The role of employee-perceived organizational support and work engagement. Frontiers in Psychology, 11, 2592-2603.

Wan, P., \& Saidin, K.B. (2018). A study of relationship between perceived organizational support and work engagement of administrative staff in newly-established universities of China. Journal of Social Science Research, 12(2), 2756-2763.

Wang, X., Guchait, P., Pa,samehmetǒ glu, A. (2020). Why should errors be tolerated? Perceived organizational support, organizationbased self-esteem and psychological well-being. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 32(5), 1987-2006.

William, S., Andrea, D., Ellinger, F., \& Sewon, K. (2021). Examining the relationships among managerial coaching, perceived organizational support, and job engagement in the US higher education context. European Journal of Training and Development, 46(5/6), 563-584.

Xiang, H., Chen, Y., \& Zhao, F. (2017). Inclusive Leadership, Perceived Organizational Support, and Work Engagement: The Moderating Role of Leadership-Member Exchange Relationship, 7th International Conference on Social Network, Communication and Education (SNCE), Shenyang, Peoples r china, Acsr-Advances in Computer Science Rese.

# INVESTIGATION OF CYBERLOAFING BEHAVIOR IN TERMS OF VARIOUS ELEMENTS: A QUALITATIVE STUDY 

DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1834
RJBM- V.10-ISS.4-2023(4)-p.174-186

## Nihan Yavuz Aksakal

Istanbul Ticaret University, Department of Business Administration, Istanbul, Turkiye. nyavuz@ticaret.edu.tr , ORCID: 0000-0002-1603-2520

| Date Received: November 5, 2023 | Date Accepted: December 27, 2023 | OAccess (cc) BY |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| To cite this document |  |  |
| Aksakal, N.Y., (2023). Investigation of cyberloafing behavior in terms of various elements: a qualitative study. Research Journal of Business and Management (RJBM), 10(4), 174-186. |  |  |
| Permanent link to this document: $\underline{\text { http://doi.org/10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1834 }}$ |  |  |
| Copyright: Published | ensed re-use rights only. |  |


#### Abstract

Purpose- In this study, the concept of cyberloafing, which we encounter more frequently as the use of technology increases day by day, is examined. In this respect, the aim of the study is to determine which situations the participants see as cyberloafing behavior, to reveal what the reasons for cyberloafing are, and to find out whether they perceive it as cyberloafing if they show cyberloafing behavior. Methodology- The research was structured within the framework of qualitative research and descriptive analysis. Interview technique was preferred in the research in order to obtain more detailed information from the participants about cyberloafing. The research was conducted with 21 participants. Findings- According to the results of the research, it was revealed that all participants showed cyberloafing behavior. Participants agreed that the definition of cyberloafing behavior is a behavior that occurs "while at work". The majority of participants define cyberloafing behavior as "spending time on the internet while at work". Participants mostly exemplified cyberloafing behavior as surfing on the internet, surfing around on social media networks, and playing games on the computer/phone. The most common reasons that may lead employees to show cyberloafing behavior are social media usage habits, fear of missing the agenda, and fear of missing out on what the entourage is doing. Participants consider the disadvantages of cyberloafing behavior to be decreased job performance, postponement of responsibilities, and increased concentration problems. Conclusion- When the study results are evaluated in general, organizations and managers can focus on reducing the negative aspects of cyberloafing behavior by providing information and training to employees about the use of the internet and technology for personal reasons. Considering the positive and negative consequences of cyberloafing behavior, it would be appropriate to develop organizational policies and strategies on this issue instead of completely eliminating cyberloafing in organizations.


Keywords: Cyberloafing, cyberslacking, qualitative research, internet usage.
JEL Codes: M10, M15, D23

## 1.INTRODUCTION

According to the Household Information Technologies Usage Survey (August 2023) conducted by Turkish Statistical Institute, the internet usage rate among individuals in the 16-74 age group has increased compared to the previous year's data and has been revealed as $87.1 \%$ in 2023 (TÜİK, 2023a). According to the Information Technologies Use in Enterprises Research (September 2023) conducted by Turkish Statistical Institute, the internet access rate of enterprises with 10 or more employees increased compared to the previous year's data and reached $96.0 \%$ in 2023 (TÜíK, 2023b). When these two data are taken together, it can be said that internet usage and internet access rates are increasing for both businesses and individuals. This situation brings the concept of virtual cyberloafing behavior, also known as the use of internet and mobile technology for personal purposes during working hours (Vitak et al., 2011: 1751), to the forefront recently.

Considering the rapid development and frequency of use of technology and communication technologies today, many activities and operations in organizations are carried out intertwined with the internet. It is stated that as internet use becomes more common, the tendency for organizations to use the internet for entertainment and non-business purposes also increases (Blanchard \& Henle, 2008: 1068). In this context, cyberloafing, which has a close relationship with the internet, is defined as the act of employees using the organization's internet access for personal purposes during working
hours (Lim, 2002: 675). Cyberloafing behavior, whose positive and negative aspects are emphasized in the literature, is becoming a concept that is being studied more and more day by day. Because it emerges as a concept that affects individuals, managers and organizations. In addition, it is seen as one of the most common ways for employees to waste time at work (Askew et al., 2014: 510). It can be a subject for businesses in various ways such as productivity (Askew, 2012), job performance (Blanchard \& Henle, 2008), counterproductive work behavior (Lim \& Teo, 2024; Babadağ, 2018), creativity, flexibility and learning (Blanchard \& Henle, 2008: 1069).

The aim of the research is to determine which situations the participants see as cyberloafing behavior, to reveal the reasons for cyberloafing, and to find out whether they perceive it as cyberloafing if they show cyberloafing behavior. In this context, first of all, the place of cyberloafing behavior in the literature will be examined, and then the data obtained by applying the interview technique with the participants will be evaluated.

## 2.LITERATURE REVIEW

### 2.1. Concept of Cyberloafing

The presence of employees on the Internet in a way that is not related to work at work is characterized as cyberloafing (Lim, 2002 cited in Koay \& Soh, 2018: 4). According to a different expression, cyberloafing is when employees use e-mail and the Internet provided by the business in a non-work-related way while working (Lim, 2002 cited in Blanchard \& Henle, 2008: 1068). From another point of view, cyberloafing can be considered as a coping strategy with negative workplace experiences (Lim \& Chen, 2012: 343). Cyberloafing is also seen as counterproductive work behavior, often with uncertain consequences for organizations (Lim \& Teo, 2024: 442). From the opposite point of view, cyberloafing can also be described as a concept that offers employees the opportunity to temporarily get away from work demands (Anandarajan \& Simmers, 2005 cited in Lim \& Chen, 2012: 344). It is also suggested that the use of the internet can lead to creativity and flexibility by diverting the person's interest as needed in the organization and create a learning environment (Blanchard \& Henle, 2008: 1068-1069).

When various definitions of the concept of cyberloafing are examined, the issues of taking place over the internet, taking place during working hours and using internet/computer systems for special purposes come to the fore (Cihan, 2018: 5). Cyberloafing behaviors include online shopping, participating in chat rooms, blogging, instant messaging, and playing online games (Henle et al. Dec., 2009:902), spending time on social media (Al-Shuaibi et al., 2013), such behaviors can be shown as an example.

In the studies conducted on cyberloafing behavior and the emergence of behavior, the concept is considered together with various theories. The ego depletion model of self-regulation proposes that self-control is like a muscle, fatigued with use and can recover with rest. In this context, it is stated that when an employee's self-control resources are exhausted, he or she tends to engage in cyberloafing behavior to compensate for his or her self-control resources (Askew et al., 2014: 510511). Apart from this, cyberloafing is also associated with the theory of planned behavior. According to the theory of planned behavior, it is stated that intentions towards cyberloafing behavior are influenced by people's own attitudes, perceived behavioral controls, and social norms that support or limit cyberloafing (Ajzen, 1991 cited in Sheikh, 2015: 173). When evaluated from the perspective of social learning theory, it is argued that an individual who uses the personal internet is more likely to interact with others in the organization who behave in a similar way, thus reinforcing the idea that personal web use is not a problem (Polzer-Debruyne, 2008: 34). In the literature, cyberloafing is also associated with withdrawal from counterproductive work behavior dimensions. It is also examined in the context of behaviors that reduce the amount of time an employee spends at work to less than the organization expects (such as taking longer breaks than allowed) (Askew et al., 2014: 511; Spector et al., 2006: 450). Interpersonal behavior theory is also associated with cyberloafing. Interpersonal behavior theory includes attitudes, social influence, and intentions. New factors such as emotional factors, habits and different sources of social influence are also included in these elements. The theory of interpersonal behavior attempts to provide a broader perspective in this context on what may lead to personal use of the internet in the organization (Moody \& Siponen, 2013: 322).

### 2.2. Dimensions of Cyberloafing Behavior

Examining different cyberloafing dimensions and classifications is very important for both organizations and managers. In order to determine the possible positive or negative effects of cyberloafing behavior, which can be seen in different ways, it is necessary to determine which cyberloafing behavior is shown. Accordingly, organizations and managers can develop practices and policies towards cyberloafing behavior.
Various cyberloafing dimensions have been examined by different researchers in the literature. Anandarajan et al. (2004) evaluate cyberloafing through different types, including destructive cyberloafing, recreational cyberloafing, and personal
learning cyberloafing (cited in Blanchard \& Henle, 2008: 1069). Lim and Teo (2005) define two types of cyberloafing activities: sending non-work-related e-mails and browsing non-work-related websites (cited in Lim \& Teo, 2024: 443). Blau et al. (2006) classify cyberloafing behavior in three different ways: surfing on the internet, non-work-related e-mail processes and being on online platforms. Li and Chung (2006), in their study on internet function and behaviors that create internet addiction, with the participation of students, divided internet usage behaviors into four classes: social function, information function, leisure function and virtual emotional function. Blanchard and Henle (2008: 1070-1071) mention two types of cyberloafing: major (serious) cyberloafing and minor cyberloafing. Minor cyberloafing can be exemplified by behaviors that can be seen with the widespread use of e-mail and the Internet in the workplace, such as sending and receiving personal e-mails or following the news. Major (serious) cyberloafing, on the other hand, is behavior that is contrary to the norms of the organization, work group or managers, and may have negative or potentially illegal consequences for the business.

### 2.3. Reasons for Cyberloafing Behavior

When cyberloafing behavior and its dimensions are examined in the literature, it appears that there are different elements such as major (serious) cyberloafing behaviors, minor cyberloafing behaviors or personal learning, entertainment purposes. Accordingly, employees' cyberloafing behaviors and the reasons for this behavior also vary. When different studies in the literature on this subject are examined, it can be said that cyberloafing behavior occurs for various individual or organizational reasons.

Situations such as boredom at work, intense work stress or job burnout, and perceived workplace norms are among the reasons for cyberloafing (Koay \& Soh, 2018: 4). It is suggested that cyberloafing can also be used to avoid negative situations that may be encountered in the workplace (Andel et al., 2019).

Doorn (2011: II) evaluates the policies regarding internet use in the organization, the use of personal computers in the organization and the new working style as potential antecedents of cyberloafing among the organizational reasons that may cause cyberloafing behavior. It is suggested that one of the factors that may be effective in the occurrence of cyberloafing behavior is perceived unfair behavior in the organization. According to the results of the study, it is stated that employees generally show cyberloafing behavior when they perceive injustice in the organization (cited in Yağcı \& Yüceler, 2016: 533). Workplace norms perceived by employees may be effective in employees' cyberloafing behavior. It is suggested that when other employees in the organization are observed engaging in cyberloafing behavior, they may perceive this as acceptable behavior and that the employee herself/himself may display cyberloafing behavior (Koay \& Soh, 2018: 4).
Lim and Teo (2024) also include various antecedents of cyberloafing in their research. In their study, where they also evaluated the results of various studies, they examined various individual factors, interpersonal factors, and situational (environmental) factors in the emergence of cyberloafing behavior. Lim and Teo (2024: 451-456) state in their study that other factors such as job dissatisfaction, inability to manage time and insufficient sleep may also affect cyberloafing behavior. It is also suggested that cyberloafing behavior can be shaped by interactions and relationships with other people in the organization. Additionally, it is stated that employees may show cyberloafing behavior in emotional situations such as feeling lonely in the organization (Lim \& Teo, 2024: 447). Babadağ (2018) states in his study that alienation from work has an effect on cyberloafing behavior. In this regard, it also considers cyberloafing behavior as a counterproductive work behavior that employees who experience alienation from work may tend towards (Babadağ, 2018: 229).
It is also stated that with the development of technology, when the time required to complete the job becomes shorter, employees can use the time they save to show cyberloafing behavior (Lee et al., 2017: 559). Various studies on cyberloafing show that work-related factors such as organizational position, job structure, and workload can be effective on cyberloafing behavior (cited in Baş, 2020: 384).

There are also studies examining various demographic factors regarding cyberloafing behaviorGarrett and Danziger (2008) stated in their study that employees with higher education levels and higher positions are more likely to show cyberloafing behavior (cited in Lee et al., 2017: 552). The study conducted by Weissenfeld et al. (2019: 1696) reveals that young people have a greater tendency to cyberloafing behavior. In a different study conducted by Jia et al. (2013), it was concluded that there is a positive relationship between extrovert personality trait and cyberloafing. Some studies in the literature suggest that the likelihood of cyberloafing behavior is higher in single individuals compared to married individuals (cited in Lim \& Teo, 2024: 449-450).

## 3. DATA AND METHODOLOGY

The aim of the research is to determine which situations the participants perceive as cyberloafing behavior, to reveal the reasons for showing cyberloafing behavior, and to find out whether they perceive it as cyberloafing if they show
cyberloafing behavior. In this regard, seven questions regarding cyberloafing behavior were asked to 21 participants in the same order. In addition, participant gender, the sector they work in, their age and the positions they work in are also examined. Participants were first included in the study by asking whether they had access to the internet while doing their jobs and at their workplaces.

This research was structured within the framework of interview technique and descriptive analysis, which are types of qualitative research. Qualitative research is seen as a method for perceiving previously known or unrecognized problems, questioning and interpreting the problem and understanding the form of the problem in its natural environment (Baltaci, 2019: 369-370). Qualitative research also supports a more in-depth understanding of the opinions received from participants (Karataş, 2015: 65). At the same time, qualitative research deals with subjective data such as individuals' experiences, perceptions and feelings about the subject (Karataş, 2015: 79). Since the subject of the research is on cyberloafing behavior, it was deemed appropriate to use the mentioned method to reveal the participants' thoughts about whether they are performing this behavior, to identify the situations of performing behavior without realizing it (to reveal their experience on the subject), to enable participants to approach the subject from a more questioning point of view, as it became important in the study within the framework of this concept. In this regard, the interview technique was preferred in the research in order to obtain more detailed information from the participants. The interview technique also tries to reveal the participant's perspective, experiences, attitudes, thoughts, and perceptions on the subject (Karataş, 2015: 71).

To ensure validity in the research, participant confirmation and expert review, which are among the methods used for the credibility of qualitative research (Başkale, 2016: 24-25; Karataş, 2015: 76), were used. In addition, the interview questions were created by the researcher within the framework of the literature review and expert review opinions in accordance with the purpose of the research.

The research was conducted with 21 participants. In qualitative research, a clear number or formula for sample size is generally not specified (Morgan \& Morgan, 2008 cited in Baltacı, 2018: 261). In qualitative research, sample size may vary depending on the depth of the data, the correct establishment of the research objectives, and the quality of the data obtained from the participants (Baltacı, 2018:261). In this regard, the repetition cycle that will occur when the information provided by the participants reaches saturation can be taken as a limit for the sample size. It is emphasized that the data collection process may be terminated if the information received from the participants begins to repeat (Baltacı, 2018: 262). Accordingly, the research was concluded as a result of data received from 21 participants.

Descriptive analysis was used as the analysis method in the study. The purpose of descriptive analysis is to organize, interpret and share the data obtained from the participants with the reader. Descriptive analysis consists of the stages of creating a framework, processing the data, describing the findings and interpreting the findings (Baltacı, 2019: 379).

## 4. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

Demographic and descriptive information about the participants is given in Table 1.12 of the participants are female and 9 are male. Although the age range of the participants varies between 27-43, the average age of the 21 participants is 34 $(33,76)$. In this context, it can be said that the participants have generally been in business life for a long time. It is seen that participants participated in the study from different sectors, including education, tourism, technology, service, pharmaceutical, construction, design, chemical, logistics, consultancy and health.
Table 1: Demographic and Descriptive Information of Participants

| Participant Number | Gender | Age | Sector | Position |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| P1 | Female | 40 | Education | Academician |
| P2 | Male | 35 | Tourism | Manager |
| P3 | Male | 38 | Education | Academician |
| P4 | Female | 28 | Tourism | Organizer |
| P5 | Female | 31 | Technology | Expert |
| P6 | Male | 35 | Service | Manager |
| P7 | Female | 30 | Pharmaceutical | Expert |
| P8 | Female | 28 | Design | Expert |
| P9 | Female | 35 | Construction | Manager |
| P10 | Male | 27 | Service | Assistant Expert |
| P11 | Male | 33 | Chemical | Expert |
| P12 | Female | 30 | Logistics | Assistant Manager |
| P13 | Male | 34 | Consultancy | Consultant/Expert |


| P14 | Female | 39 | Technology | Manager |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| P15 | Female | 32 | Service | Group Leader |
| P16 | Female | 34 | Service | Regional Director |
| P17 | Male | 43 | Logistics | Assistant Manager |
| P18 | Male | 41 | Tourism | Senior Expert |
| P19 | Female | 34 | Health | Technician |
| P20 | Female | 33 | Education | Academician |
| P21 | Male | 29 | Service | Sales Consultant |

Various characteristics were determined by conducting interviews with participants regarding cyberloafing behavior. The themes regarding the participants' own definitions of what cyberloafing behavior is are given in Chart 1.

## Chart 1: Definition of Cyberloafing According to Participants

Definition of Cyberloafing According to Participants

*Participants answered the interview question by providing more than one definition.
** Theme 4 is located in the yellow area. Based on the response given, Theme 4 is "trying to deceive others" response.
As shown in Chart 1, participants were asked to define what "cyberloafing behavior" is based on their own. The only element that is common to all of the responses received from the participants is that the cyberloafing behavior takes place "while at work". Apart from that, the participants interpret the concept differently according to themselves. The majority of participants (19 participants) define cyberloafing behavior as "spending time on the internet while at work". 17 participants interpret it as "using a phone for personal purposes while at work", 12 participants interpret it as "using unintended technology while at work" and 1 participant interprets it as "trying to deceive others while at work". Some remarkable answers given by the participants are given below.
"Cyberloafing is when employees spend time on the internet instead of doing their duties during working hours at work." (P1)
"It is the use of technological devices and phones in an unintended manner while at work. We start to examine different things that interest us without realizing it and this wastes our time." (P9)
"It means pretending to be working at work but not actually working and trying to deceive others in this way." (P4)
In order to reveal which behaviors the participants perceive as cyberloafing, the participants were asked to indicate examples of cyberloafing behavior. The examples given by the participants regarding cyberloafing behavior are as given in Chart 2.

## Chart 2: Examples of Cyberloafing Given by Participants


*Participants answered the question by giving more than one example.
As shown in Graph 2, the participants mostly answered surfing on the internet (14) for examples of cyberloafing behavior. Then, surfing around on social media networks (10), playing games on computer/phone (8), watching TV series/movies/videos (7), shopping online (6), doing anything non-urgent on the computer that is unrelated to work (4), online personal training programs (1) answers are given as examples. Some remarkable answers given by the participants are given below.
"I consider everything we do using technology that has nothing to do with work and is not urgent at the moment as cyberloafing. Because if the thing we are interested in is not urgent, I think we can do this during non-working hours. "If we do this during working hours, it would be cyberloafing for me." (P17)
"I consider online training programs within the company as cyberloafing. Or meetings attended by the majority of people... Because these can sometimes be seen as a way to loaf work at that moment." (P7)
"Being on the internet for purposes other than work. If I do this for my own purposes during working hours, it is like taking a break from work, resting. But it allows me to continue working with a better performance afterwards." (P9)
"Examples such as surfing social media networks and shopping online would be a direct example of cyberloafing for me. Because I don't want to miss the current events on social media or on the agenda while doing business. After looking at these channels, I can return to work more easily." (P16)

Participants were asked what the reasons might lead an employee to engage in cyberloafing behavior. The answers received are given in Chart 3. As shown in Chart 3, the most common among the participants are social media usage habits (19 participants), fear of missing the agenda (18 participants), fear of missing out on what the entourage is doing (16 participants), need for physical or mental rest (14 participants), job stress (13 participants) and learning-researchdevelopment (13 participants). Some remarkable answers given by the participants are given below.

Chart 3: The Reasons That May Lead an Employee to Show Cyberloafing Behavior According to the Participants

*Participants answered the question by giving more than one reason.
"Especially when I'm at work, I want to see what the people around me are doing at that moment. Or I want to share something on social media. That's why I check my social media accounts briefly but frequently. I think an employee may also engage in cyberloafing for these reasons. Because we all have many social media accounts now." (P19)
"To find out what's on the agenda and to follow the national and international agenda." (P21)
"People may have low expectations from the institution due to reasons such as not feeling like they belong to the institution or profession, or thinking that there is unfair management in the institution. For this reason, they may also show cyberloafing behavior. I also think personal problems may cause this behavior." (P20)
"Social media habit and like of research.. We can usually perceive cyberloafing as negative, but someone who likes research or someone who wants to improve themselves about something can also do cyberloafing while at work at that moment." (P12)
"It can be done to get away from the problems experienced due to job stress." (P11)
"If I'm bored with work at that moment and my motivation is low, I can do cyberloafing. Therefore, I can consider boredom and loss of motivation as a reason for cyberloafing." (P13)

Participants were asked whether they exhibited cyberloafing behavior and it was also evaluated whether they perceived these behaviors as cyberloafing. In this regard, all of the participants state that they show cyberloafing behavior during the day. However, some participants also stated that they did not see some situations as cyberloafing, depending on the content of their work. Some interesting answers from participants to this question are given below.
"Yes, I can say that I exhibit cyberloafing behavior throughout the day, even every day. It's not very long hours, but I see it as short breaks. For example, if I am doing a difficult calculation task, I can watch short videos for 15-20 minutes to rest my mind. ...Apart from this, I am frequently active in online communication groups, but I do not see this as cyberloafing, for example. Because, due to the work I do, we provide most of the communication here." (P2)
"Because of the job I do, I can also work in the field. While waiting in the field or during free time, I can use my phone, access the internet and social media, and watch videos. Actually, I am working during working hours at that moment, but since there is no work that I am actively interested in at that moment, I do not see it as cyberloafing because I am waiting." (P21)
"I use the internet for my personal business during working hours. For example, using online banking. This way, I feel less need for short-term leaves. That's why I don't see such examples as a negative cyberloafing behavior. ...I also browse social media. Sometimes I realize that I spend long periods of time, but I see this as reducing stress and clearing my mind." (P18)
"I may want to browse social media because I want to follow my friends and see what they are up to. Or, I may suddenly want to access online shopping when I am having difficulty with my job. The reason for this may be to make the situation easier and more fun when I am having difficulty in reading-learning or at work." (P15)
"Since the job descriptions in the institution are not clear, I am assigned to work that is legally outside my duties and responsibilities. Therefore, to do these jobs, I research on the internet or watch training videos." (P20)

Participants were asked how long, on average, they exhibited cyberloafing behavior during the day. The answers given by the participants generally indicate that they engage in cyberloafing behavior for around 1-2 hours on average.

Participants were asked about the daily average number of new job arrivals and the time it took to respond to work/emails, and they were asked to consider cyberloafing behaviors accordingly. Accordingly, the prominent answers given by the participants are given below.
"On average, I receive 10-12 e-mails a day. I try to answer e-mails as they arrive and do the tasks in order according to my workload. If I don't have a busy day, I can engage in more cyberloafing, and I limit this behavior when work comes up. Because I have to finish the job. If my workload is high that day, I can't be said to do much cyberloafing. I think I can say that workload is important in this regard." (P5)
"The average number of emails I have to answer per day is around 30. Also, I have an average of 30 emails to keep track of. My response speed is usually between 2-3 minutes. I can have 30-40 minute breaks a day between my jobs. At this point, I can use the internet outside of work." (P9)
"I receive an average of at least 10 e-mails a day. The speed at which I respond to emails varies depending on the urgency of the job. If I have longer time to complete the work, I can act more relaxed and use the internet in a way that is not related to work. I also use online communication applications very frequently due to my work. That's why I usually have business-related conversations on these platforms. And for this reason, I do not see the time I spend on these platforms as cyberloafing." (P2)

Participants were asked whether there were disadvantages of cyberloafing behavior and what they might be. The codes created from the answers given by the participants are shown in Chart 4. Accordingly, the most common answers were received from the participants: decrease in job performance (18), postponement of responsibilities (15), increase in concentration problems (14), decrease in productivity (12), increase in workforce loss (8). Some interesting answers from participants to this question are given below.

Chart 4: Disadvantages of Cyberloafing Behavior According to Participants' Responses

"There may be problems focusing after cyberloafing. Perception/interest may be dispersed. Additionally, since I spend time on the internet or social media, I may need longer time to finish the task at my hand." (P2)
"When more time is spent in the virtual world, it can reduce real-world social interactions, causing social isolation in the organization." (P4)
"I think the biggest disadvantages are postponing responsibilities and decreasing performance." (P3)
"It can cause problems such as work disruptions, backlogs, and concentration problems. Thus, there may be disadvantages such as decreasing performance. But I also think it has advantages. Relaxing ourselves without interrupting work during work breaks can provide a little motivation when we return to work." (P9)
"It can be seen as decreasing productivity and losing focus on work." (P8)

## 5. CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS

Considering the answers given by the participants, it can be interpreted that they do not see cyberloafing behavior only as the use of internet and technology resources provided by the organization for non-work purposes, but that they think that cyberloafing behavior can also be exhibited by the use of personal devices during working hours in a way that is not related to work.

Considering the possibilities of accessing the internet and information technologies, the situations in which cyberloafing behavior can be seen may increase due to the frequent use of rapidly advancing technology in organizations. In this regard, a question was asked to reveal which behaviors the participants perceived as cyberloafing behavior. The majority of the participants considered everything related to "surfing on the internet", which is frequently included in the definitions of cyberloafing, as an example of cyberloafing. The second most common answer is "surfing around on social media networks". There are studies in the literature stating that the increase in social media use increases cyberloafing in the work environment (Garrett \& Danziger, 2008 cited in Gürbüz et al., 2023: 235). Playing games on the computer/phone was also given by the participants as examples of cyberloafing. In various studies, behaviors such as playing online games are considered among cyberloafing behaviors (Karaoğlan Yılmaz et al., 2023; Şimşek \& Şimşek, 2019; Koay \& Soh, 2018: 5). Watching TV series/movies/videos and shopping online were also given by the participants as examples of cyberloafing. In the study conducted by Koay and Soh (2018: 4), examples of cyberloafing include watching online videos and shopping online. In different studies, online shopping is described as cyberloafing behavior (Ugrin \& Pearson: 2013, 812; Şimşek \& Şimşek, 2019: 100). In this regard, it can be said that the answers given in the study are parallel to the literature.

Among the reasons that may lead participants to show cyberloafing behavior, the most common reasons were social media usage habits (19 participants), fear of missing the agenda (18 participants) and fear of missing out on what the entourage is doing (16 participants). The answers given by the participants to the questions about the reasons that may lead an employee to exhibit cyberloafing behavior and their own situations of cyberloafing behavior include surfing on social media networks, social media usage habits fear of missing out on what the entourage is doing, and fear of missing the agenda. Fear of missing out (FoMO), which has started to be studied more recently, is defined as the fear of missing developments in social networks and not being able to keep up with them (Przybylski et al., 2013 cited in Gürbüz et al., 2023: 235). It has been revealed that individuals spend longer time on social media platforms due to FoMO (Dossey, 2014 cited in Gürbüz et al., 2023: 235).) It is stated that individuals experiencing FoMO also use social media platforms in processes where they need to complete work-related tasks (Jabeen, 2023: 2). In this context, FoMO, which can be evaluated within the answers given by the participants, can be interpreted as a reason for cyberloafing behavior.

Participants state that cyberloafing behavior may also occur due to the need to listen physically or mentally. In the literature, positive aspects of cyberloafing behavior, such as coping with fatigue and allowing the employee to rest and gain energy, are also mentioned (Çetin \& Akyelli, 2020: 45-54; Arslan \& Demir, 2016: 1628).

Participants also answered "learning, research, development" (13 participants) among the reasons that may lead them to show cyberloafing behavior. In the literature, attention is also drawn to increased knowledge, skill acquisition, learning and development, and creativity (Belanger \& Van Slyke, 2002 cited in Aghaz \& Sheikh, 2016: 52; Blanchard \& Henle, 2008: 1069), which are considered among the positive consequences of cyberloafing behavior. In this context, although the answers from the participants to the question generally draw attention to the negative aspects of cyberloafing behavior, they can also be interpreted as positive aspects of the behavior.

Participants also answered "job stress" (13 participants) among the reasons that may lead them to show cyberloafing behavior. In the literature, situations such as job boredom, intense work stress or job burnout, and perceived workplace norms are among the reasons for cyberloafing (Koay \& Soh, 2018: 4). In this context, considering the results in the literature, it can be thought that work stress may be among the reasons for cyberloafing behavior.

In the study conducted by Pindek et al. (2018), workplace boredom is considered to be an important negative consequence of insufficient workload. And cyberloafing behavior is evaluated in the study as an employee's coping mechanism with boredom rather than an inefficient work behavior (Pindek et al., 2018: 151). In this context, the answer given by the participants to "boredom" (12 participants) among the reasons that may lead them to show cyberloafing behavior is also parallel to the results of the stated study. Various studies on cyberloafing also indicate that work-related factors such as workload can be effective on cyberloafing behavior (cited in Baş, 2020: 384). At the same time, it can be said that the answer given by the participants as "too little or too much workload" (8 participants) among the reasons that may lead them to show cyberloafing behavior is also in line with the results of the stated study. Particularly as stated by the participant coded P5, it can be interpreted that whether the workload is low or high is important in terms of this issue. At the same time, when the participants' answers to the question about arrival time and response time for a new job are evaluated, it can be interpreted that cyberloafing behaviors are also related to daily workload.

Lack of motivation was also cited by the participants (10 participants) among the reasons that may lead them to exhibit cyberloafing behavior. There were participants who thought that a person might exhibit cyberloafing behavior due to lack of motivation. However, among the answers given to the last question, the idea of "...Relaxing ourselves without interrupting work during work breaks can provide a little motivation when we return to work. (P9)" is also included as an advantage of cyberloafing. In this context, employees taking small breaks to ensure that they work with motivation can be considered among the advantages that cyberloafing can provide.

All participants state that they engage in cyberloafing behavior for an average of 1-2 hours at most during the day. In a study conducted by Arslan and Demir (2016: 1631-1632) with nurses on the subject of cyberloafing, it was revealed that the time participants spent on the internet was mostly less than 1 hour. In a different study conducted by Günel and Güler (2022: 58) in public institutions, according to the answers given by the participants, it is stated that they mostly use the internet and computers at work for 1-2 hours not related to work. Considering the studies in the literature, it can be thought that this situation may be related to sectors and job contents.

In the study conducted by Syed et al. (2020: 16), it is stated that cyberloafing and social media significantly affect the job performance of employees. In the study where the findings obtained from the studies are evaluated, it is stated that cyberloafing has both positive and negative effects on the job performance of employees. It is also stated in different studies conducted in the literature that social media addiction negatively affects work performance and productivity (Turan et al., 2021: 837). In this context, the majority of the participants (19 participants) cited "social media usage habit" among the reasons that may cause cyberloafing behavior, "decreased work performance" (18 participants) and "decrease in
productivity" (12 participants) that the participants saw as among the disadvantages of cyberloafing behavior may be associated with results such as. Participants also mentioned postponing responsibilities ( 15 participants) and increasing concentration problems (14 participants) among the disadvantages that cyberloafing behavior may create. In the context of the subject, situations such as employees disrupting the flow of work in the organization or postponing work are also seen as cyberloafing (Karaca \& Karaca, 2019: 29). It is stated that external locus of control is among some of the reasons that lead employees to show cyberloafing behavior. It is stated that, under the influence of various factors, cyberloafing behavior may cause various consequences such as decreased productivity and procrastination behavior in organizations (Yıldız \& Yıldız, 2015: 3-10 et al.; Örücü \& Hasırcı, 2021: 25).

As can be seen, cyberloafing behavior can be considered with both positive and negative aspects. Organizations and managers can focus on reducing the negative aspects of cyberloafing behavior by providing information and training to employees about the use of the internet and technology for personal reasons. They may additionally set organizational procedures and norms in this regard. They can reconsider employees' rest and break periods, workload distribution, and control mechanisms in the context of the subject.
It is thought that the study will contribute to the literature, especially since it reflects different perspectives of the participants in terms of the reasons for cyberloafing behavior and includes the reasons for showing cyberloafing behavior. In this regard, organizations and managers can focus on eliminating the negative aspects of cyberloafing behavior by taking into account the mentioned factors. In addition, in line with the responses received from the participants, it is thought that it will contribute to the literature in addressing variables that have not been adequately investigated in existing research in more detail.

Although the results of the research are valid only for the sample that participated, it is not possible to generalize it when evaluated for all employees. In this regard, it may be recommended to conduct studies on the concept in the future with a larger number of participants from various fields. Considering that technological elements such as information technologies and internet infrastructure change rapidly in our age, different results may be obtained in similar studies on the concept in the future. Especially with the rapid advancement of technology, examples of cyberloafing behavior, the time spent displaying cyberloafing behavior, and the advantages and disadvantages of cyberloafing may also differ. Considering the mentioned situation and the positive and negative consequences of cyberloafing behavior, it would be appropriate to develop organizational policies and strategies on this issue, instead of completely eliminating cyberloafing in organizations.

## REFERENCES

Aghaz, A., Sheikh, A. (2016). Cyberloafing and job burnout: An investigation in the knowledge-intensive sector, Computers in Human Behavior, 62, 51-60.

Ajzen, I. (1991). The theory of planned behavior, Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, 50 (2), 179-211. https://doi.org/10.1016/0749-5978(91)90020-T
Al-Shuaibi, A. S. i., Shamsudin, F.M., Subramaniam, C. (2013). Do Human Resource Management Practices Matter in Reducing Cyberloafing at Work: Evidence from Jordan, The 2013 WEI International Academic Conference Proceedings, The West East Institute, 37-47, İstanbul, Türkiye.
Anandarajan, M., Devine, P., \& Simmers, C. (2004). A multidimensional scaling approach to personal web usage in the workplace. In M. Anandarajan \& C. Simmers (Eds.), Personal web usage in the workplace: A guide to effective human resource management. Hershey, PA: Information Science Publishing.

Anandarajan, M., Simmers, C.A., (2005). Developinghuman capital through personal web use in the work-place: mapping employee perceptions, Communicationsof the Association for Information System, 15, 776-791.

Andel, S.A., Kessler, S.R., Pindek, S., Kleinman, G., Spector, P.E. (2019). Is cyberloafing more complex than we originally thought? Cyberloafing as a coping response to workplace aggression exposure, Computers in Human Behavior, 101, 124-130.

Arslan, E.T., Demir, H. (2016). Sanal Kaytarma: Bir Kamu Kurumunda Hemşireler Üzerinde Ampirik Bir Araştırma, Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi, 9 (43), 1626-1638.
Askew, K. L. (2012). The Relationship between Cyberloafing and Task Performance and An Examination of the Theory of Planned Behavior as a Model of Cyberloafing. Doctoral Dissertation, University of South Florida College of Arts and Sciences, USA.
Askew, K., Buckner, J.E., Taing, M.U., Ilie, A., Bauer, J.A., Coovert, M.D. (2014). Explaining Cyberloafing: The Role of The Theory of Planned Behavior, Computers in Human Behavior, 36, 510-519.
Babadağ, M. (2018). İşe Yabancılaşmanın Sanal Kaytarma Üzerindeki Etkisi, Balıkesir Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 21 (39), 207-239.

Baltacı, A. (2018). Nitel Araştırmalarda Örnekleme Yöntemleri ve Örnek Hacmi Sorunsalı Üzerine Kavramsal Bir İnceleme, Bitlis Eren Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 7 (1), 231-274.

Baltacı, A. (2019). Nitel Araştırma Süreci: Nitel Bir Araştırma Nasıl Yapılır?, Ahi Evran Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 5 (2), 368388.

Baş, M. (2020). Sanal Kaytarma Davranışının Nedenleri ve Sonuçlarının İncelenmesi, International Marmara Social Sciences Congress (Imascon 2020 - Autumn) Proceedings Book, 381-390.

Başkale, H. (2016). Nitel Araştırmalarda Geçerlik, Güvenirlik ve Örneklem Büyüklüğünün Belirlenmesi, Dokuz Eylül Üniversitesi Hemşirelik Fakültesi Elektronik Dergisi, 9 (1), 23-28.

Belanger, F., Van Slyke, C. (2002). Abuse or learning?, Communications of the ACM, 45 (1), 64-65.
Blanchard, A.L., Henle, C.A. (2008). Correlates of different forms of cyberloafing: The role of norms and external locus of control, Computers in Human Behavior, 24 (3), 1067-1084. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2007.03.008

Blau, G., Yang, Y., Ward-Cook, K. (2006). Testing a Measure of Cyberloafing, Journal of Allied Health, 35 (1), 9-17.
Cihan, A. (2018). Sanal Kaytarma ve Algılanan Mesleki Etik Arasındaki ilişkiye Yönelik Bir Araştırma, Aksaray Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Yönetim Bilişim Sistemleri Anabilim Dalı, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, Aksaray.

Çetin, C., Akyelli, N. (2020). Sanal Kaytarma ve İş Doyumu ilişkisi, İzmir Kâtip Çelebi Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi, 3 (1), 41-59.

Doorn, O. (2011, Ağustos). Cyberloafing: A Multi-Dimensional Construct Placed İn A Theoretical Framework. Master Thesis. Hollanda.
Dossey, L. (2014). FOMO, digital dementia, and our dangerous experiment. Explore: The Journal of Science and Healing, 10(2): 69-73. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.explore.2013.12.008

Garrett, R. K., Danziger, J. N. (2008). On cyberslacking: Workplacestatus and personal internet use at work, CyberPsychology \& Behavior,11 (3), 287-292.

Günel, Y., Güler, A. (2022). Çalışanların Kamu Kurumlarında Sanal Kaytarma Davranışına Yönelik Düşüncelerinin İncelenmesi. Journal of Academic Opinion, 2 (2), 54-66.

Gürbüz, F., Bayraklı, M., Gezgin, D.M. (2023). The effect of cyberloafing behaviors on smartphone addiction in university students: The mediating role of fear of missing out, Journal of Educational Technology \& Online Learning, 6 (1), 234-248.

Henle, C.A., Kohut, G., Booth, R. (2009). Designing electronic use policies to enhance employee perceptions of fairness and to reduce cyberloafing: An empirical test of justice theory, Computers in Human Behavior, 25 (4), 902-910. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2009.03.005

Jabeen, F., Tandon, A., Sithipolvanichgul, J., Srivastava, S., Dhir, A. (2023). Social media-induced fear of missing out (FoMO) and social media fatigue: The role of narcissism, comparison and disclosure, Journal of Business Research, 159. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2023.113693

Jia, H., Jia, R., \& Karau, S. (2013). Cyberloafing and Personality: The Impact of the Big Five Traits and Workplace Situational Factors. Journal of Leadership \& Organizational Studies, 20, 358-365. https://doi.org/10.1177\%2F1548051813488208

Karaca, A., Karaca, B. (2019). Sağlık Çalışanlarının Sanal Kaytarma Davranışları İle Örgütsel Özdeşleşme Düzeyleri Arasındaki ilişkinin İncelenmesi: Bir Kamu Hastanesi Örneği, Ankara Sağlık Hizmetleri Dergisi, 18 (1), 27-39.

Karataş, Z. (2015). Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri, Manevi Temelli Sosyal Hizmet Araştırmaları Dergisi, 1 (1), 62-80.
Karaoğlan Yılmaz, F.G., Yılmaz, R., Sulak, S. (2023). Cyberloafing in the Online Synchronous Lessons: Exploring Variables Associated with University Students' Cyberloafing Behaviors, Technology, Knowledge and Learning. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10758-023-09676-4

Koay, K.Y., Soh, P.C.H. (2018). Should cyberloafing be allowed in the workplace?, Human Resource Management International Digest, 26 (7), 4-6, DOI 10.1108/HRMID-05-2018-0107.

Lee, D.C., Lin, S.H., Ma, H.L., Wu, D.B. (2017). Use of a Modified UTAUT Model to Investigate the Perspectives of Internet Access Device Users, International Journal of Human-Computer Interaction, 33 (7), 549-564. https://doi.org/10.1080/10447318.2016.1261249

Li, S. M.,Chung, T. M. (2006). Internet function and internet addictive behavior, Computers in Human Behavior, 22(6), 1067-1071.
Lim, V.K.G. (2002). The IT way of loafing on the job: cyberloafing, neutralizing and organizational justice, Journal of Organizational Behavior, 23 (5), 675-694. https://doi.org/10.1002/job. 161

Lim, V.K.G., Chen, D.J.Q. (2012). Cyberloafing at the workplace: gain or drain on work?, Behaviour \& Information Technology, 31 (4), $343-$ 353. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01449290903353054

Lim, V. K. G., Teo, T. S. (2005). Prevalence, perceived seriousness, justification and regulation of cyberloafing in Singapore: An exploratory study, Information \& Management, 42 (8), 1081-1093. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.im.2004.12.002

Lim, V.K.G., Teo, T.S.H. (2024). Cyberloafing: A review and research agenda, Applied Psychology, 73 (1), 441-484. (First published: 22 November 2022).

Moody, G.D., Siponen, M. (2013). Using the theory of interpersonal behavior to explain non-work-related personal use of the Internet at work, Information \& Management, 50, 322-335.

Morgan, D. L., Morgan, R. K. (2008). Single-Case Research Methods for the Behavioral and Health Sciences. SAGE Publications.
Örücü, E, Hasırcı, I. (2021). Organizasyonlarda Sinizm ile Sanal Kaytarma Davranışı Ilişkisinde Çalışan Yaşının Düzenleyici Etkisi, Yönetim ve Ekonomi Dergisi, 28 (1), 23-43.

Pindek, S., Krajcevska, A., Spector, P.E. (2018). Cyberloafing as a coping mechanism: Dealing with workplace boredom, Computers in Human Behavior, 86, 147-152.

Polzer-Debruyne, A. M. (2008). Psychological and Workplace Attributes that Influence Personal Web Use (PWU),YayınlanmamıG̣ Doktora Tezi, Endüstiryel/Örgütsel Psikoloji, Massey Üniversitesi, New Zealand.

Przybylski, A. K., Murayama, K., DeHaan, C. R., \& Gladwell, V. (2013). Motivational, emotional, and behavioral correlates of fear of missing out. Computer in Human Behaviours, 29(4), 1841-1848. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2013.02.014

Sheikh, A., Atashgah, M.S., Adibzadegan, M. (2015). The antecedents of cyberloafing: A case study in an Iranian copper industry, Computers in Human Behavior, 51 (A), 172-179. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2015.04.042
Spector, P.E., Fox, S., Penney, L.M., Bruursema, K., Goh, A., Kessler, S. (2006). The dimensionality of counterproductivity: Are all counterproductive behaviors created equal?, Journal of Vocational Behavior, 68 (3), 446-460. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2005.10.005
Syed, S. Singh, H., Thangaraju, S.K., Bakri, N.E., Hwa, K.Y., a/I Kusalavan, P. (2020). The Impact of Cyberloafing on Employees' Job Performance: A Review of Literature, Journal of Advances in Management Sciences \& Information Systems, 6, 16-28.

Şimşek, A, Şimşek, E. (2019). Beneficial and Detrimental Effects of Cyberloafing in the Workplace, Journal of Organizational Behavior Review, 1 (1), 97-114.

Turan, G.B., Özer, Z., Atan, G. (2021). The relationship between cyberloafing levels and social media addiction among nursing students, Perspectives in Psychiatric Care, 57, 836-843.

TÜíK (Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu) (2023a). Hanehalkı Bilişim Teknolojileri (BT) Kullanım Araştırması, 2023, https://data.tuik.gov.tr/Bulten/Index?p=Hanehalki-Bilisim-Teknolojileri-(BT)-Kullanim-Arastirmasi-202349407\#:~:text=Hanehalk\�\�\ bili\�\�im\ teknolojileri\ kullan\�\�m\ ara\�\�t\�\�rmas\�\�,artarak\%2 0\%95\%2C5\%20oldu.\&text=\%C4\%BOnternet\%20kullan\%C4\%B1m\%20oran\%C4\%B1\%2C\%2016\%2D74,y\%C4\%B1|\%C4\%B1nda\%20\%87\%2C1\% 20oldu. (Erişim Tarihi: 26.12.2023).
TÜíK (Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu) (2023b). Girişimlerde Bilişim Teknolojileri Kullanım Araştırması, 2023, https://data.tuik.gov.tr/Bulten/Index?p=Girisimlerde-Bilisim-Teknolojileri-Kullanim-Arastirmasi-2023-49393 (Erişim Tarihi: 26.12.2023).

Ugrin, J.C., Pearson, J.M. (2013). The effects of sanctions and stigmas on cyberloafing, Computers in Human Behavior, 29, 812-820.
Vitak, J., Crouse, J., LaRose, R. (2011). Personal Internet Use at Work: Understanding Cyberslacking, Computers in Human Behavior, 27 (5), 1751-1759.

Weissenfeld,K., Abramova, O., Krasnova, H. (2019). Antecedents for Cyberloafing - A Literature Review, 14th International Conference on Wirtschaftsinformatik, February 24-27, 2019, Siegen, Germany.

Yağcı, M., Yüceler, A. (2016). Kavramsal boyutlarıyla sanal kaytarma, International Journal of Social Sciences and Education Research, 2 (2), 531-540.

Yıldız, B., Yıldız, H. (2015). İş Yaşamındaki Sanal Kaytarma Davranışlarının Hukuki Yönden İncelenmesi, Yönetim ve Ekonomi Araştırmaları Dergisi, 13(3), 1-17.

# EMPLOYEES' ENGAGEMENT ON THE PERFORMANCE OF TANZANIAN PUBLIC HIGHER LEARNING INSTITUTIONS: A CASE OF INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL WORK 

DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1835
RJBM- V.10-ISS.4-2023(5)-p.187-194

Dominic Nkolimwa
Institute of Social Work, Department of Human Resource Management, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. nkolimwad@yahoo.com , ORCID: 0009-0005-7600-0992
Date Received: Date Accepted: $\quad$ (cc) BY

To cite this document
Nkolimwa, D., (2023). Employees' engagement on the performance of Tanzanian public higher learning instıtutions: a case of institute of social work. Research Journal of Business and Management (RJBM), 10(4), 187-194.
Permanent link to this document: http://doi.org/10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1835
Copyright: Published by PressAcademia and limited licensed re-use rights only.


#### Abstract

Purpose-This article aimed at analyzing the influence of employees' engagement on public higher learning institutions performance in Tanzania. The performance of organizations worldwide depends on many factors including the availability of talented, committed and engaged employees. Hence, employees' engagement has an impact on organizational performance and national development at large. Methodology-A quantitative research strategy and a positivism approach were used in the study. The article applied the correlation research design. Multiple regression analysis was used to analyze data from 84 questionnaires from the Institute of Social Work, Dar es Salaam. Three hypotheses were tested to verify the model on the Employees' engagement on organizational performance. Findings-The results demonstrate that Employee Involvement (EI), Employee Working Environment (EWE) and Employee Motivation (EM) have positive influence on Organizational performance (OP). Conclusion- Managers in public and private organizations should seriously consider engaging employees in various decisions and duties performed at work in order to continue improving the performance of the organizations.


Keywords: Employees' engagement, organizational performance, working environment, involvement, motivation
JEL Codes: M31, E21, D11

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The performance of organizations in developed and developing nations depends on many factors including the availability of talented, committed and engaged employees. The employee's engagement is referred to as a positive and fulfilling work related state of mind that is characterized by vision, dedication and absorption (Schaufeli, Salanova, Gonzales-Roma, \& Bakker, 2002). However, the performance of higher learning institutions especially in the developing countries including Tanzania is questionable. Higher learning intuitions, as any other organizations, are facing many challenges which are caused by stiff competitions stimulated by today's fast changing business environment which ultimately affects organizational performance due to lack of employees' engagement at work(Al-dalahmeh et al., 2018). This pushed organizations to bolster their hiring, motivational and retention strategies of highly talented, skillful and engaged employees in order to realize organizational performance.

Most organizations intending to improve performance concentrate on hiring talented employees due to the changing marketing environment that attracts efficiency (Akbar et al., 2023). Having employees who view their work as meaningful and thus engage in it is essential because individuals give firms a competitive advantage through their unique contributions (Stoyanova \& Iliev). This is attributed to the fact that having people who are upbeat, enthusiastic, and motivated by their work would immediately improve the performance of the firm (Anitha, 2014). Different scholars like Akbar, Natsir and Husen, 2023; Afifuddin, 2015; Joseph, 2015 and Marwansyah (2016) described performance as a result of work in quality and quantity that is achieved by employees in carrying out duties under the given responsibilities. This is the most important part of work behavior of an individual which can be interpreted as the results achieved by a person according to the standards that apply to the work.

According to Mangkunegara (2015), performance is the work achieved or attained by someone based on job requirements. Employees' engagement has a significant role towards the realization of the objectives of an organization, which can be
observed through performance. Therefore, the performance of an individual can be influenced by the level of his commitment to work. Myilswamy and Gayatri (2014) argue that the degree of engagement at work determines people's productivity and their willingness to stay with the organization. Hence, employees' engagement refers to as a situation whereby employees are fully occupied in their work and emotionally attached to their organization(Osman et al., 2022). Employees must be dedicated towards work and should take it as a challenge towards realizing the organizational performance rather than changing the workplace as a place where individuals have nothing creative to do and just sit idle the whole day. Masa'deh, Khalaf \& Obeidat (2018) argued that employee engagement is the property of the relation between the organizations with their employees.

Wasilowski (2018) argues that managers believe that engagement has a lot to do with employees as regards work experience and how employees are treated in the organization. Bale and Pillay (2021) argue that a highly engaged employee can increase productivity and performance while reducing costs related to hiring and retention and increasing their competitive advantage (Sudibjo \& Riantini, 2023). This is an important aspect since it has a lot to do with emotions which are fundamentally related to drive bottom line success in a company (Grubert et al., 2023). The employee engagement initiative has a direct impact on the organization's productivity. Scholars argue that employee engagement has important elements like involvement, empowerment, job motivation, organizational commitment, working environment, management support and trust to the employees which should be taken into serious consideration and trust to the employees (Almawali et al., 2021). The key factors in engagement are such as alignment of employees toward strategy; enabling employees to have the capability to engage themselves and creating the sense of engagement to the work (Hanaysha, 2016).

This article used employee involvement, working environment and motivation as important elements in engagement towards realizing organizational performance. The knowledge on how employee's engagement can influence performance in public higher learning institutions is scant in Tanzania. Therefore, this article intends to fill that gap and assist managers and policy makers as to how to engage employees and take efforts to manage the knowledge of the employees so as to increase the performance of the organization using employee's engagement as a tool for organizational performance.

## 2. LITERATURE REVIEW

The Dual Factor Theory of Motivation developed by Hertzberg (1966) fits in this article because it relates with Employee's engagement and employee's performance as a result of employee's motivation. This is a classical theory of employee motivation which stimulates the morale of employees in the organization. The job itself must provide sufficient varieties, sufficient complexities, sufficient challenges and sufficient skills to engage the worker (Githinji \& Muli, 2018). It can take the form of motivation by the work itself when individuals feel that their work is important, interesting and challenging and provides them with a degree of autonomy, opportunities to achieve and advance, and scope to use and develop their skills and abilities (Armstrong, 2012). The social exchange theory was borrowed in order to enrich this article. Githinji and Muli (2018) recommended the social exchange theory as a strong theoretical rationale for employees' engagement on organizational performance. The recommended theory argues that commitments are created through a series of interactions between parties who are in a state of reciprocal interdependence. According to the theory, relationships develop into trusting, loyal and mutual commitments over time as long as parties abide by certain rules. This is consistent with the description of engagement as a reciprocal relationship of trust and respect between employer and employee (Politeknik et al., 2016). Therefore, it requires an organization's executives and managers to communicate their expectations clearly and extensively to the employees and create a working environment and corporate culture in which engagement would thrive (Ochonogor \& Amah, 2021). According to Githinji and Muli (2018), the social exchange theory describes engagement because it sees feelings of loyalty, commitment and discretionary effort as all being forms of reciprocation by employees to a good employer.

### 2.1. Employees' Engagement and Organizational Performance

Yalabik et al.(2017) maintain that employees' engagement is among the important factors that impact organizational performance because it stimulates the morale of workers. It deals with emotional, cognitive and behavioral states of the employee, with an emphasis on the desired organizational outcome (Grubert et al., 2023). It pushes ahead the organization's and employee's agenda (Bergström \& Martínez 2016). Shuck and Vollard (2010) state that employee engagement means the intellectual and emotional involvement of employees within the organization. Hence, no organization can maximize profit without investing on employees' engagement by creating a relationship between employees and their work (Muller et al., 2018). Organizations that observe employee engagement tend to reduce absenteeism, accidents, turnover and also improve employee performance as well as organizational efficiency (Hussein et al., 2017). There is a positive relationship between engagement and direct indicators of the effectiveness of the organization such as productivity, quality, performance, customer satisfaction, profit and business development because engaged employees become excited about their work in the organization. Engaged employees are expected to feel emotionally, physically, interaction and intimacy (Engidaw, 2021). The action influences an individual to develop a positive, affective and psychological work-related behaviour (Wasilowski, 2018).

The engaged employees express and prepare themselves emotionally, cognitively, and physically to do their work tasks (Ameen \& Baharom). Therefore, to engage employees is very important towards achieving useful business performance outcomes in the organizations (Almawali et al., 2021).

### 2.2. Employees Involvement and Organizational Performance

Employees who are involved especially at important roles tend to be devoted to working (Pranitasari, 2022). The effectiveness and efficiency of the organization depend on the joint efforts of all employees who have been involved. The theory of employee involvement is considered to be one of the most influential theories of business. Ahmeda, Khanb, Thitivesab, Siraphatthadab and Phumdarab (2020) posit that it predicts that employees who work passionately and engaged usually perform better than others and contribute to the success of the organization. Many organizations are faced with challenges of managing and empowering their employees to actively participate in decision making (Amhalhal et. Al., 2015). In the current economic environment, organizations require creative and innovative employees who can take initiative, embrace change, stimulate innovation and cope with high uncertainty in the market (Azmy, 2019). The idea of empowerment involves the employees being provided with a significant degree of freedom and flexibility to make decisions relating to work without direct involvement of the top management (Pranitasari, 2022). Employee's involvement and participation thus contribute greatly to how organizations make decision and run their businesses (Singh, 2016). It is very important that organizations create an environment for all employees with open feedback to make sure that employees are treated with equal opportunities. Therefore, the following hypothesis was developed:

H1: There is a positive relationship between employees' involvement and organizational performance.

### 2.3. Working Environment and Organizational Performance

According to Danish, Ramzan and Ahmad (2013), work environment is related to the climate of a particular organization where its employees do their duties. Work environment is a key factor that affects employee's satisfaction and commitment toward organizational performance. According to Almawali, Hafit, Hassan (2021), work environment should be conducive such that it protects employees from all work-related risks. In order to protect employees from work-related risks, organizations should design their work environments in a way that they can increase the level of employees' commitment and motivation, which would ultimately translate into favorable outcomes (Sittar, 2020). Undoubtedly, facilitative and safe work environment can attract employees as their needs are likely to be satisfied (Bustasar et al., 2019). For employees to be more engaged and work hard when they feel that they are secured, organizations should design their work environments in a way that can increase the level of employees' commitment and motivation. Therefore, managers should improve the aspects of work environment to ensure the welfare of their employees. Work environment comprises factors such as involvement; team cohesion; supervisor's support; task orientation; work pressure; autonomy; clarity; innovation, physical comfort, psychological climate, working conditions and organizational culture. Therefore, the following hypothesis was developed:

H2: There is a positive relationship between working environment and organizational performance.

### 2.4. Employees Motivation and Organizational Performance

Motivation is the energy that moves employees toward performing an action at work (Engidaw, 2021). It strengthens the willingness of employees to work and, in turn, it increases the organization's effectiveness and competence (Parashar, 2016). It is an important factor for understanding and managing organizational behavior because it explains why employees behave or act in a particular way (Engidaw, 2021). When employees are well motivated in the organization, they tend to be engaged in the work or an action which stimulates organizational performance. Therefore, motivation has a major role to improve the performance of the employees in higher learning institutions (Sutapa et al., 2022). The significance of motivation at workplace cuts across all working environments and plays a commendable role to public and private organizations. Mariza (2016) argues that motivation is categorized into monetary which is based on bonuses, salaries, and wages to causal employees while another category of motivation is non-monetary such as working condition, recognition, job status, job security, and job enrichment. Khan (2013) argues that there is a positive relationship between intrinsic motivation which encompasses job appreciation, satisfaction, and stress on employee engagement and extrinsic motivation which comprises job security, good wages, promotion and growth, and recognition on employee engagement (Ochonogor \& Amah, 2021). Therefore, both intrinsic and extrinsic motivation have a strong positive impact on employee engagement. Therefore, the following hypothesis was developed:

H3: There is a positive relationship between employees' motivation and organizational performance

### 2.5. Conceptual Framework

The framework proposed for this study was based on theoretical results as described in the introduction. The conceptual framework underlies the relationship between employees' engagement which is measured by employees' involvement, employees' working environment and employees' motivation on organizational performance at public higher leaning institutions in Tanzania. Based on the description above, the conceptual framework of this study can be described as follows:

Figure 1: Research Conceptual Framework

> EG

## OP



## 3. DATA AND METHODOLOGY

The study applied a quantitative research strategy and a positivism research approach. The correlation research design was employed so as to determine the extent of relationship between independent and dependent variables by using statistical data. The research design was selected because it recognizes the trends and patterns of data. The five-point Likert Scale questionnaire was used to gather data from employees at the Institute of Social Work, Dar es Salaam where 84 respondents were involved. The SPSS version 21 was used to perform the regression analysis. The Cronbach alpha was used in a pilot study to test the reliability and validity of data in this study.

## 4. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

Multiple regression analysis is often used to explore the predictive ability of a set of independent variables on dependent variable (Prasad, 2018). It allows comparison of the power of independent variables to find the best set of variables that predicts a dependent variable (Frost, 2017). The article intended to investigate the relationship between employee's engagement and organizational performance. It focused on three variables namely Employees Involvement, Employees Working Environment and Employees Motivation. Each variable was evaluated in terms of its predictive power (Ochonogor \& Amah, 2021). Multiple regression analysis was used to determine the strength of the relationship between variables, to determine how well the data fits the model, how much of the variance in the dependent variable is explained by the independent variables, to provide an indication of the relative contribution of each independent variable, to determine the statistical significance of the results in both the model and individual independent variables, to estimate model coefficient and the last is to test the hypothesis of the study (Ochonogor \& Amah, 2021). The following are the results of the analysis done by multiple regression aimed at achieving the study objectives on employees' engagement on organizational performance.

The model summary of correlation coefficients is represented by R. The table below presents the information from the analysis. Frost (2017) states that if R lies between 0.10 and 0.29 it is an indication of a small correlation, 0.30 and 0.49 indicates medium while 0.50 and 1.0 indicates large correlation.

Table 1: Model Summary ${ }^{\text {b }}$

| Model | R | R Square | Adjusted R Square | Std. Error of the Estimate | Durbin-Watson |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | $.580^{\circ}$ | 0.64 | 0.61 | 3.51931 | 2.008 |

a. Predictors: (Constant), EM, EWE, EI
b. Dependent Variable: OP

The results from the model summary indicate that the value of correlation coefficient $R$ is 0.580 . This implies that there is large correlation between variables. The value shows that all Employees' engagement factors are a good indicator for the occurrence of organizational performance. This has also been supported by Frost (2017) who argued that if the value of correlation coefficient $R$ is above 50 percent, then it indicates that the data fits the model, which implies that there is a strong
relationship between variables. The coefficient of determination presented by $R$ square was used to find out the variance. The $R$ square is defined as the proportion of variance in the organizational performance that can be explained by employees' engagement factors. It is the proportions of the variation counted for by the regression model above and beyond the means model. Frost (2017) proposed that the highest R square (above $50 \%$ ) is considered to be one of the indicators of a good model. The results from the analysis (Table 1.0) indicate that the value of $R$ square is 64.7. This value implies that employees' engagement factors explain 64.7 percent of the variability of organizational performance and only 36.3 percent of variation is caused by other factors indicated in the model. That means the proposed employees' engagement factors exactly predict the organizational performance. The adjusted $R$ square shows how much of the variance the organizational performance is explained by the employees' engagement factors included in the model. Table 1.0 shows that 0.061 percent of the variation in the organizational performance is explained by the employees' engagement factors. Frost (2017) argues that the low discrepancy between $R$ square and adjusted $R$ square indicates a good fit of the model. Table 1.0 indicates $R$ square which is 64.7 percent and adjusted $R$ square which is 0.061 percent whose discrepancy is low at 3 percent which is less than 5 percent. This small deviation implies that they are closely related. Stephen (2018) argued that for a good model, adjusted R square should always be less than 5 percent.

The study intends to test whether the independent variables (employees' engagement factors) significantly predict the dependent variable statistically (Organizational performance). F - test was used to test whether the overall regression model is a good fit for the data at the selected probability level. It was intended to check if the Engagement factors (EI, EWE and EM are statistically predicting the Organizational performance (OP). The predictor is said to be statistically significant if the $P$ value is less than 0.05 and if more, then they are said to be insignificant. The data in ANOVA table show that the F-ratio is given by $F(3,79)=13.348, \mathrm{P} 0.000$. The good fit of data in this analysis of regression model implies that the Employee Engagement is statistically significant predicting the organizational performance as indicated in the data.

Table 2: ANOVA ${ }^{\text {a }}$

| Model | Regression | Sum of Squares | Df | Mean Square | F | Sig. |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Res.951 | 3 | 165.317 | 13.348 | $.000^{\text {b }}$ |  |
|  | Residual | 978.458 | 79 | 12.386 |  |  |
|  | Total | 1474.410 | 82 |  |  |  |

a. Dependent Variable: OP
b. Predictors: (Constant), EM, EWE, EI

Source: Field data (2023)
It was important for the study to know the contribution of each employee engagement factors, included in the model, in predicting the organizational performance. The results will provide an indication to the Institute of Social Work to concentrate much on employees' engaged factors which have a high contribution if it plans to improve performance. The study proposed that each employee's engagement included in the model has a contribution to the organizational performance.

The study used the standardized coefficients from coefficient Table 1.3 which compares different employees' engagement factors by considering the $\beta$ values. Using standardized coefficient means that all values for each of the different engagement factors have been converted to the same scale so that comparison can be made simple. The coefficients table represents the standardized coefficient $\beta$ values for each employee's engaged factors and their significance marked. The $\beta$ values represent the contribution of each employee's engagement factor to organizational performance. Results from table 3 show that the $\beta$ values under standardized coefficients for EI, EWE and EM were $0.296,0.317$ and 0.473 respectively. Since the study intended to compare the contribution of each engagement factor by considering the $\beta$ values, the results imply EM has the largest beta value followed by EWE. This implies that EM has a stronger or greater explanatory power to the organizational performance followed by EWE while EI has the least contribution.

Table 3: Evaluation of Contribution of Each Employee's Engagement Factor Model Coefficients ${ }^{\text {a }}$

| Model | Unstandardized Coefficients |  | Standardized Coefficients | t | Sig. | Collinearity Statistics |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | B | Std. Error |  |  |  | Tolerance | VIF |
| (Constant) | 15.228 | 2.291 |  | 6.646 | . 000 |  |  |
| El | . 064 | . 068 | . 296 | . 939 | . 035 | . 805 | 1.242 |
| EWE | . 072 | . 061 | . 317 | 1.167 | . 024 | . 834 | 1.199 |
| EM | . 331 | . 076 | . 473 | 4.344 | . 000 | . 708 | 1.412 |

Dependent Variable: OP
The multiple regression analysis was used to test the proposed hypotheses which are $\mathrm{H} 1, \mathrm{H} 2$ and H 3 related to organizational performance and employees' engagement related factors. Results from the regression coefficient show that there is a significant relationship between EI and OP ( $\beta=0.296$, Significant at 0.035 ), another result from the regression coefficient
shows that there is a significant relationship between EWE and OP ( $\beta=0.317$, Significant at 0.024 ). The results from the regression coefficient also show that there is a significant relationship between EM and OP ( $\beta=0.473$, Significant at 0.000 ).

### 4.1. DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

The results show that EI has a positive influence on realizing the organizational performance. Therefore, if organizations tend to involve employees in various decisions and duties, the performance tends to rise. Grubert, Steuber and Meynhardt (2023) supported the findings by arguing that involved employees are motivated to continue working hard. Employees' involvement in the organization especially in higher leaning institutions is a key factor in maintaining and stimulating the morale of staff at worker place. This has also been supported by Ochonogor \& Amah (2021) who urgued that employees should be involved in decision making. The attitude towards working hard, with a sense of ownership, rises when employees have been involved by management (Jalal \& Hanaysha 2016). The employees' working environment is vital towards realizing organizational performance. This concurs with the findings of this article which revealed that EWE has a positive influence in realizing OP. Hanaysha (2016) maintained that improving employees' working environment is significant towards assuring health and safety at workplace to all employees. The environment which has been maintained provides an alert to employees about the risks associated with work (Oakman, \& Bartram, 2017). The results revealed that EM has a strong influence on realizing OP since employees become committed if they have been motivated. Mariza (2016) argued that management has a significant role to play towards motivating employees at work. Motivation appeared to be strongly preferred by all employees at all workplaces and higher leaning institutions (Hanaysha 2016). Employees can be motivated to work hard if there are achievements, recognition, promotion opportunities, responsibilities, and opportunities for personal growth (Engidaw 2021).

## 5. CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS

The article investigated the influence of employees' engagement on Public Higher Learning Institutions' Performance. The literature informed that employees' engagement has a contribution to the organizational performance (Bergström \& Martínez 2016). Employees' engagement is measured by employees' involvement, working environment and motivation. Therefore, this article concludes that employees' engagement has a significant influence on the organizational performance. Hence, management of the organizations should place emphasis on the employees' engagement in order to realize organizational performance.
The results revealed that employee engagement has a significant relationship with Public Higher Learning Institutions' Performance. Thus, organizational performance will be improved if all organizations, especially public organizations, emphasize on employees' engagement. Managers should therefore put emphasis on engaging employees in making various decisions in the organization like involving employees in preparation and design of strategies which aim at improving performance.

## REFERENCES

Al-dalahmeh, M., Masa'deh, R., Abu Khalaf, R. K., \& Obeidat, B. Y. (2018). The effect of employee engagement on organizational performance via the mediating role of job satisfaction: the case of IT employees in Jordanian banking sector. Modern Applied Science, 12(6), 17-29.

Almawali, H., Hafit, N. I. A., \& Hassan, N. (2021). The mediating effects of employee engagement on motivational factors and job performance. International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences, 11(12),2316-2332.

Azmy, A. (2019). Employee engagement factors in a higher education institution. Binus Business Review, 10(3), 187-200.
Bustasar, B., Sumarsih, S., \& Nugroho, K. U. Z. (2019, April 15). The relationship between motivation, engagement and performance of employee. https://doi.org/10.2991/icetep-18.2019.19.

Christian Gillitzer and Nalini Prasad, (2018). The effect of consumer sentiment on consumption: cross-sectional evidence from elections, American Economic Journal: Macroeconomics, 10, (4), 234-69.

Engidaw, A. E. (2021). The effect of motivation on employee engagement in public sectors: in the case of North Wollo zone. Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship, 10(1),1-15

Frost, J. (2017). How to interpret R-squared in regression analysis. Retrieved fromhttp://statisticsbyjim.com/regression/interpretregression.Accessed on 18 October 2023.

Githinji, J. W., \& Muli, J. (2018). Employee engagement strategies and employee performance of Air Kenya Limited. International Academic Journal of Human Resource and Business Administration |, 3(4), 397-412.

Grubert, T., Steuber, J., \& Meynhardt, T. (2023). Engagement at a higher level: The effects of public value on employee engagement, the organization, and society. Current Psychology, 42(24), 20948-20966.
Hanaysha, J. (2016). Testing the effects of employee engagement, work environment, and organizational learning on organizational commitment. Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 229, 289-297.

Hussein, N., Anis Abdul Razak, N., \& Khalil Omar, M. (2017). Learning organization and work engagement: an empirical evidence of a higher learning institution in Malaysia. In Information Management and Business Review,9(1)17-22.

Muller, R., Smith, E., \& Lillah, R. (2018). The impact of employee engagement on organisational performance: a balanced scorecard approach. International Journal of economics and finance studies, 10(2).22--39.

Mutua Kilonzo, T., Were, S., Odhiambo, R., \& Kenyatta, J. (n.d.). Influence of Employee engagement on the performance of teachers in secondary schools in Machakos County in Kenya. In International Journal of Novel Research in Humanity and Social Sciences,5(1),52-71.

Oakman,J.\&Bartram,T. (2017). Occupational health and safety management practices and musculoskeletal disorders in aged care Are policy, practice and research evidence aligned? Journal of Health Organization and Management, 31(3),331-346..

Ochonogor, D. I., \& Amah, E. (2021). Managerial resourcefulness and quality service delivery: the place of information sharing in public sector organizations. Business, Management and Economics Research, 73, 101-107.

Osman, Z., Samad, R. R., Alwi, N. H., \& Ahmad Khan, B. N. (2022). Direct and ındirect relationship of employee engagement, corporate image, employee loyalty, and business performance among private business organizations. International Journal of Academic Research in Economics and Management Sciences, 11(3).,483-498.

Politeknik, I. M., Tunggal, G., \& Mariza, I. (2016). The impact of employees' motivation and engagement on employees' performance of manufacturing companies in Jakarta Indonesia ,14(15),10611-10628.

Pranitasari, D. (2022). Development of work engagement model based on organizational culture method. International Journal of Instruction, 15(2), 861-884.

Rezza Akbar, A., Natsir, M., \& Syam Husen, Y. (2023). The influence of Perceptions of Organizational Support, Employee Engagement on Job Satisfaction and Employee Performance Regional Financial and asset Management Agency Southeast Sulawesi province.Global Scientific Journal.11(3),211-228.

Singh, R. (2016). The impact of intrinsic and extrinsic motivators on employee engagement in information organizations. Journal of Education for Library and Information Science Online, 57(2), 197-206.

Sittar, K. (2020). Relationship of Work Engagements and Job Performance of University Teachers. Bulletin of Education and Research Journal,42(1),167-183.

Stoyanova, T., Iliev, I. (2017). Employee engagement factor for organizational excellence. International Journal of Business and Economic Sciences Applied Research, 109 (1), 23-29.

Sudibjo, N., \& Riantini, M. G. D. (2023). Factors affecting teachers' work engagement: the case of private school teachers in Jakarta Metropolitan, Indonesia. REICE. Revista Iberoamericana Sobre Calidad, Eficacia y Cambio En Educacion, 21(1), 119-137.

Sutapa, N., Anna, I., Edi, I., \& Soeharijadi, S. (2022). Employee engagement index: a case study of academic support staff of higher education. Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research, 650 (4 ),440-447

Wasilowski, S. (2018). Employee engagement in higher education. Journal of Social Science Research, 12(2), 2699-2712.

## Appendix 1: QUESTIONNAIRE

Dear respondents, this questionnaire intends to collect information on the research titled Employees' Engagement on the performance of Tanzanian public higher learning institutions. The main objective of this study is to analyze the Influence of Employees' Engagement on the Performance of Tanzanian Public Higher Learning Institutions. You are kindly requested to provide relevant information that will assist the achievement of the study objectives. I assure that the collected information will be confidential and the names of individual and organization will not be included in the reporting of the findings. Thank you for your understanding and cooperation in this study.

1. Sex
(a) Male
(b) Female
2. Age
(a) 18 or 35
(b) $36-45$
(c) 46-55
(e) Above 55years
3. Marital status
(a) Single
(b) Married
(c) Divorced
(d) Widow
4. What is your highest level of education?
(a) Diploma level
(c) Bachelor degree level
(d) Postgraduate qualification

Strongly disagree=1, Disagree=2, I don't know=3, Agree=4 and Strongly agree=5

| S/N | Statement | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A | Employees Involvement |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 | lam involved in decision making |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7 | lam involved in preparation of organization objectives |  |  |  |  |  |
| 8 | lam involved to implement the organization objectives |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | The strategies of organization aim to raise my performance |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 | lam results oriented toward meeting the organization objective |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 | lam part and parcel of the organization success |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 | lam determined to realize the organization objectives |  |  |  |  |  |
| B | Employees Working Environment | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| 13 | The working environment support employee's performance. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 14 | I am attracted with working environment |  |  |  |  |  |
| 15 | There all needed facilities with support efficiency at work |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 | Creativity at work is important to me in order rise efficiencies |  |  |  |  |  |
| 17 | The organization provides the conducive working environment |  |  |  |  |  |
| 18 | lam determined to realize the organization objectives |  |  |  |  |  |
| C | Employees Motivation | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| 19 | Iam eager to work hard at the organization |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 | Iam happy to work with this organization |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 | My company provides fair promotion opportunities |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 | Promotion should be based on performance |  |  |  |  |  |
| 23 | My job is beneficial to my career |  |  |  |  |  |
| 24 | My boss allows me to have my ability fully utilize |  |  |  |  |  |
| 25 | It's enjoyable to go to work |  |  |  |  |  |
| 26 | The companies value my service |  |  |  |  |  |
| 27 | I am satisfied with the working condition |  |  |  |  |  |
| D | Organisation Performance | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| 28 | Iam empowered to realize the organization performance. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 29 | Management do empower employees in archiving organization formance |  |  |  |  |  |
| 30 | Employees' empowerment influence organization performance |  |  |  |  |  |
| 31 | I understand the plan and priorities of the organization. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 32 | I understand the purpose and objectives of the organization |  |  |  |  |  |
| 33 | I have received an appropriate training to do my job efficiently and effectively. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 34 | I understand how our working environment has an impact on our organization goals. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 35 | Top management always communicate values and vision of our organization |  |  |  |  |  |

# MUSIC STREAMING SERVICES AND THE DRIVERS OF CUSTOMER PURCHASE 

## DOI: 10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1836 <br> RJBM- V.10-ISS.4-2023(6)-p.195-206

## Mariana Lopes Barata ${ }^{1}$, José Monteiro Barata²

${ }^{1}$ Independent Consultant, Lisbon, Portugal. mariana Iba@hotmail.com , ORCID: 0009-0003-9773-419X
${ }^{2}$ University of Lisbon, Lisbon School of Economics and Management, Lisbon, Portugal. jmbarata@iseg.ulisboa.pt , ORCID: 0000-0002-2953-6875

| Date Received: August 2, 2023 | Date Accepted: November 5, 2023 | ( access | BY |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

To cite this document
Barata, M.L., Barata, J.M., (2023). Music streaming services and the drivers of customer purchase. Research Journal of Business and Management (RJBM), 10(4), 195-206.
Permemant link to this document: http://doi.org/10.17261/Pressacademia.2023.1836
Copyright: Published by PressAcademia and limited licenced re-use rights only.

## ABSTRACT

Purpose- The music industry has undergone tremendous changes in relation to its production, distribution, and consumption habits due to the exponential development of new technologies, namely streaming platforms. This study aims to understand the factors that influence music consumption through streaming platforms, particularly analysing the differences between premium and freemium users on the intention to adopt premium (paid) versions of a music streaming service.
Methodology- UTAUT2 model (version of the Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology, applied to the consumer side) was used as framework. Based on data collected from 324 music streaming services users (premium and freemium), this study was tested using structural equation modelling (SEM).
Findings- Our findings, focused fundamentally on the initial period of pandemics (2020-2021), confirm that facilitating conditions, price value and performance expectancy play the most important role in influencing the intention to use a paid music streaming service for the premium sample. However, the freemium sample finds habit, price value and hedonic motivation the variables most relevant.
Conclusion- The research contributes insights into music streaming services consumer behaviour, providing several theoretical and practical implications to music streaming services providers.

Keywords: Adoption, customer purchase, music streaming services, SEM, UTAUT2
JEL Codes: M31, M37, C88, L82

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Since the beginning of the oldest societies, music has played a fundamental role in the life of human beings, being undeniably a form of universal expression that unites old and future generations culturally and emotionally (Larsen et al., 2009, 2010; Naveed et al., 2017). The importance of music in our society has led to creating an industry that includes all the concepts inherent to this thematic, such as its structure, organisation, distribution, and profitability. This industry, made up mostly of countless record labels, has experienced golden times through sales of physical copies, thus monopolising the production and consumption of music. However, from 2001 onwards, it began to suffer the impact of the appearance of new technologies, thus initiating a digital age where the consumer has a greater capacity for decision (Arditi, 2014). In particular, the growth of streaming services has revolutionised consuming music (IFPI, 2020). It is known that since 2010., for instance, the number of users of the Spotify streaming platform has increased from 15 to 100 million worldwide (Aguiar \& Waldfogel, 2018). Spotify currently (2023) has 356 million users.

These platforms are based on a relatively recent business model (Sinclair \& Tinson, 2017) that basically consists of the service proposal according to two modalities: adoption of an account exempt from monthly costs, but in return, users are exposed to advertising and other types of restrictions (freemium model), or, on the contrary, the user pays a monthly fee and takes full advantage of the service (premium model), with this modality contributing to a substantial increase in the profits of this industry (Arditi, 2018; Wlömert \& Papies, 2016).

The aim of freemium is to attract the largest possible number of users, increasing the probability of many upgrading to a premium account, where there are several advantages like no advertising, better sound quality and the possibility of offline access (Dörr et al., 2013; Wagner et al., 2014). However, it is still unclear how choosing between accounts is done; thus, it is
crucial for music streaming companies to understand consumers' motivations in order to convert free users into paid subscribers (Chen et al., 2018b).

As already said, given the importance of music in all cultures and considering the millions of users of music streaming services, it is imperative to know more about this digital phenomenon and which factors influence their use. There is little research on the willingness to pay for services when a free version is available (Chen et al., 2018a; Dörr et al., 2013), as well as the new freemium model (Doerr et al., 2010; Oestreicher-singer \& Zalmanson, 2013; Wagner et al., 2014). In fact, despite previous attempts to better understand the use of streaming music services, there is a distinct gap of knowledge about what the effective drivers of adoption of paid streaming music services are, and to which extent "acceptance of use" models may be applied in this context or not. Based on the fact that streaming services have made it possible to bridge the gap between the "old age of music" and the digital revolution it has undergone, this study aims to shed light on the generic patterns of use of these services by consumers, particularly, to understand the consumer decision process when subscribing to a paid account on a streaming service. Based on the Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology 2 (UTAUT2), a new extended model is conceptualised and tested, using data collected from 324 music streaming services users.

The remainder of this paper is structured as follows. First, we provide the conceptual background through a deeper analysis of music streaming services and technology adoption models. This is followed by the suggestion of the research model and hypotheses development. Next, we provide the research methodology, data analysis and discussion of results. We conclude with some directions for future work.

## 2.THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

### 2.1. Music Streaming Services

A music streaming service offers several functions to its users, the main focus being the supply of extensive libraries of songs and albums through an internet connection (Zimmer, 2018). Nowadays, these services are the fastest growing music option (Cesareo \& Pastore, 2014). There are two types of streaming services users: those who subscribe to an account exempt from usufruct fees and financed by advertising and those who sign up for an account, paying a monthly fee, which offers several features (Thomes, 2013). Thomes (2013) revealed that listening to music on streaming services, free of charge with advertising, may not cause loss of revenues; actually, it could help in the fight against piracy. These services make profits by combining a financial model through advertising, called freemium, and another type of account with access to other kinds of functionalities, in which the user pays a monthly fee, the premium model (Doerr et al., 2010), which should stand out for its more advantageous features and functions, compared to its free version (Ye et al., 2004). Currently, the most popular music streaming service globally is Spotify, founded in Stockholm, 2006.

### 2.2. Adoption Models

Understanding what consumers value and their consumption patterns is vital for the effective growth of any service. Due to the digitalisation process that the music industry has experienced, the need to understand the process of adopting online music streaming services better, namely which factors weigh in the decision to purchase a premium model, has become primordial (Chen et al., 2018b). Music streaming services are considered Information Systems (IS), where the first theories about adopting technology were applied. The basic concept of technology adoption can be described as the combination of individual reactions, intentions to use and actual use (Venkatesh et al., 2003).

One of the most fundamental adoption theories is the Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA) (Fishbein \& Ajzen, 1975), being used as a basis for many other adoption theories about consumer behaviour. Cesareo \& Pastore (2014) used TRA to measure consumers' willingness to try a subscription-based music streaming service, where variables such as "importance and exposure to music", "involvement and interest", and "attitude towards online piracy" were used.

The Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB) (Ajzen, 1991) is an extension of the previous TRA and has been applied in several studies within the music streaming services adoption context. Also, the Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) (Davis, 1989) is one of the most important models in the context of technology adoption and use (Cheong \& Park, 2005), based on TRA. Some derivations of this model, like TAM2, have also been proposed (Venkatesh \& Bala, 2008; Y.-S. Wang, 2008).

In 2003, Venkatesh et al. (2003) developed the Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology (UTAUT), based on eight prominent theories: TRA (Theory of Reasoned Action), TPB (Theory of Planned Behaviour), TAM (Technology Acceptance Model), MM (Motivation Model), C-TAM-TPB (combined TAM and TPB), MPCU (Model of PC Utilization), DIT (Diffusion of Innovation Theory) and SCT (Social Cognitive Theory). Consisting of four constructs: performance expectancy, effort expectancy, social influence and facilitating conditions, UTAUT obtained satisfactory results (Venkatesh et al., 2003, 2012).

This study intends to use this theory, more specifically, an extension (UTAUT2), as a basis to create the explanatory model in our context of music streaming services. It is a robust theory. Generally, these models can provide a detailed understanding of the phenomena under investigation and a result of successive applications and adaptations. Specifically, the major
advantage of the model is that it has included the demographic and experience as factor in the model itself. This makes it more suitable to be used for service-oriented research in business to consumer field. For instance, the traditional TAM models were more often used to adoption of technologies (computers, IT).

In the following section, we will describe UTAUT2 and its relevance. After UTAUT's release, the model was tested in different contexts and in 2012, it was extended to the consumer context, developing UTAUT2 (Venkatesh et al., 2012). UTAUT2 is an extension of the original model, adding three new constructs: hedonic motivation, price value and habit. Age, gender and experience were considered moderators of behavioural intention and technology use (Venkatesh et al., 2012).

## 3. RESEARCH MODEL AND HYPOTHESES

### 3.1. The Model

The model tested in this study is the theoretical UTAUT2 model. The conceptual model is shown in Figure1.
Figure 1: Results Model


The hypotheses that constitute the conceptual model will be presented and developed in the following section, as well as the theoretical research that supports and justifies them.

### 3.2. UTAUT2 Variables

Performance expectancy - Performance expectancy is defined as the degree to which using technology will benefit consumers in performing certain activities (Venkatesh et al., 2012). Although online music services aim to deliver an entertaining experience, they also provide functional benefits to people (Chu \& Lu, 2007). Some attributes from the utilitarian character of the music streaming services are tools to find music, organise titles, sort through rankings and commentary, access product information and facilitate music sharing (Hampton-Sosa, 2017). Hence, we formulate the following hypothesis: H1, Performance expectancy (PE) is positively related to behavioural intention (BI).

Effort expectancy - Effort expectancy is described as the degree of ease associated with consumers' use of technology (Venkatesh et al., 2012). According to Kwong \& Park (2008), perceived ease of use is a significant predictor of intention. In the in-depth semi-structured interviews previously carried out, most participants affirmed that the ease of access was decisive in the use of music streaming services. Effort expectancy was considered an important variable in estimating intention to use IS. Thus, the following hypothesis is formulated: H2, Effort expectancy (EE) is positively related to behavioural intention (BI).

Social influence - Social influence is defined as the extent to which consumers perceive that important others (e.g. family and friends) believe they should use a particular technology (Venkatesh et al., 2012). Social influence was based on the subjective norm construct, present in other adoption theories, and its function is to measure the social pressure applied to the individual, which leads him to perform a certain behaviour or not (Ajzen, 1991; Fishbein \& Ajzen, 1975). Therefore, we hypothesise: H3, Social influence (IS) is positively related to behavioural intention (BI).

Facilitating conditions - Facilitating conditions refer to consumers perceptions of the resources and support available to perform a behaviour (Venkatesh et al., 2012). This construct and its roots have been thought to include technological aspects
designed to remove barriers to use (Venkatesh et al., 2003). Therefore, we hypothesise: H4, Facilitating conditions (FC) are positively related to behavioural intention (BI).
Hedonic motivation - Hedonic Motivation is defined as the fun or pleasure derived from using a technology (Venkatesh et al., 2012). In this context, it is the degree to which a user expects enjoyment from listening to streamed music (Chen et al., 2018b). Music streaming services can be considered a hedonic IS due to the creation of leisure and entertainment for their users instead of carrying out a practical task (Chen et al., 2018b). Consequently, this variable is suggested as a factor that impacts a consumer's intention to purchase these services and therefore, we hypothesise: H 5 , Hedonic motivation (HM) is positively related to behavioural intention (BI).
Price value - Price value is defined as consumers' cognitive trade-off between the perceived benefits of the applications and the monetary cost for using them (Dodds et al., 1991; Venkatesh et al., 2012). In the context of music streaming services, it is known that the paid version coexists in a highly competitive environment due to the existence of free alternatives. Thus, it makes sense that price value also determines users' intention to purchase the premium version. Therefore, we hypothesise: H6, Price value (PV) is positively related to behavioural intention (BI).

Habit - Habit is defined as a perceptual construct that reflects the results of prior experiences (Venkatesh et al., 2012). Past behaviour seems to be determinant to the present behaviour (Ajzen, 2002; S. Kim \& Malhotra, 2005), impacting behavioural intention (Venkatesh, 2000). According to Ye et al. (2004), a consumer's willingness to pay for an online service can be related to how habitual the consumer has become to using that service. Therefore, we hypothesise: H 7 , Habit ( H ) is positively related to behavioural intention (BI).

## 4. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

A questionnaire was distributed to a sample of members of the target population. The questionnaire was designed around the proposed conceptual model. The indicators for each construct were adapted from literature. See Annex for identification of the measurement scale (items, dimensions and source).

The instrument chosen to measure responses was the 7-Point Likert type scale: strongly disagree to strongly agree. The questionnaire was drafted in English and reviewed for content validity by language experts from a university. Because the questionnaire was administered in Portugal, the English version of the instrument was translated into Portuguese by a professional translator. The questionnaire was then reverse translated into English to confirm translation equivalence. The questionnaire was pilot tested with a sample of 20 subjects to optimise the instrument. Results confirm that the scales were reliable and valid. The questionnaire was launched online on social networks. Thus, the sampling process used in this study was non-probabilistic (lacobucci \& Churchill, 2018). The survey was active for one month (August 21 to September 21, 2020) on the Qualtrics platform. Demographic and social questions were included in order to be more sensitive about sample characteristics and envision some possible research hypotheses in the future. By not defining age limits, it was possible to acquire a greater variety of responses.

Data was used to test and analyse both the measurement and structural model. Four hundred and thirty-nine anonymous and confidential responses were collected, and 324 of these proved to be valid for this study's purpose. The final sample is gender-balanced, with a slightly higher number of female respondents ( $50.9 \%$ ). It presents an age distribution ranging from under 18 to 64 years old, the majority being in the age group of $18-34$ years ( $83 \%$ ). Regarding education, more than $77 \%$ of the elements hold a tertiary qualification.

## 5. RESULTS

After the descriptive analysis of the sample (performed using the statistical software SPSS), it was possible to conclude that regarding gender, the sample was balanced and around $77 \%$ have a level of education at the 'College' level ( $77.1 \%$ ). Furthermore, the majority lies in the age group of 18-34 years ( $83 \%$ ).

In this section, we tested the developed hypotheses in order to verify the extended model of UTAUT in the context of music streaming services. The theoretical research model was estimated using the statistical method structural equation modelling (SEM), which is used to evaluate the validity of theories with empirical data (Ringle et al., 2015). SEM combines two techniques: covariance-based (as represented by LISREL) and variance-based, in which partial least squares (PLS) path modelling is the most prominent representative (Henseler et al., 2009). PLS was applied to test our model with SmartPLS 3.0 software (Ringle et al., 2015). This powerful technique was chosen mainly due to its capability of avoiding small sample size problems and, as it is recommended in an early stage of theoretical development, to test and validate exploratory models motivated by prediction and exploration (Henseler et al., 2009).

### 5.1. Measurement Model

In order to assess the measurement model, reliability and validity were evaluated. Reliability was tested using the composite reliability (measure of internal consistency that considers that indicators have different loadings) and Cronbach's alpha (estimator based on the indicator intercorrelations), which can generally be interpreted in the same way. As shown in Table 1 (premium model) and in Table 2 (freemium model), both measures show values very close to or larger than 0.7 for all constructs, satisfying all requirements and thus, admitting construct reliability. The indicator reliability was evaluated through loading values. We used the recommendation of retaining indicators with standardised loading larger than 0.7 (Churchill, 1979; Hair et al., 2014; Henseler et al., 2009).
The average variance extracted (AVE) is used to assess convergent validity, it being defined as the mean value of the squared loadings of the indicators associated with the construct. AVE values should be at least 0.5 to indicate sufficient convergent validity, and thus, the construct could explain more than half of the variance of its indicators, on average (Hair et al., 2014; Henseler et al., 2009). As seen in Table 1, all constructs present values higher than 0.5.

Table 1: Premium's Quality Criteria and Factor Loadings

| Constructs | AVE | Composite reliability | Cronbach's alpha | Item | Loadings | t-value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Performance Expectancy (PE) | 0.575 | 0.802 | 0.642 | PE1 | 0.815 | 21.647 |
|  |  |  |  | PE2 | 0.687 | 9.403 |
|  |  |  |  | PE3 | 0.768 | 12.941 |
| Effort <br> Expectancy (EE) | 0.740 | 0.919 | 0.883 | EE1 | 0.840 | 12.456 |
|  |  |  |  | EE2 | 0.883 | 37.786 |
|  |  |  |  | EE3 | 0.918 | 36.565 |
|  |  |  |  | EE4 | 0.794 | 14.414 |
| Social Influence (SI) | 0.854 | 0.946 | 0.915 | SI1 | 0.903 | 21.085 |
|  |  |  |  | SI2 | 0.913 | 20.105 |
|  |  |  |  | SI3 | 0.956 | 33.398 |
| Facilitating Conditions (FC) | 0.632 | 0.837 | 0.718 | FC1 | 0.852 | 28.758 |
|  |  |  |  | FC2 | 0.750 | 10.373 |
|  |  |  |  | FC3 | 0.780 | 12.143 |
| Hedonic Motivation (HM) | 0.647 | 0.845 | 0.723 | HM1 | 0.815 | 17.292 |
|  |  |  |  | HM2 | 0.678 | 10.051 |
|  |  |  |  | HM3 | 0.905 | 50.301 |
| Price Value (PV) | 0.897 | 0.963 | 0.943 | PV1 | 0.936 | 50.673 |
|  |  |  |  | PV2 | 0.951 | 81.623 |
|  |  |  |  | PV3 | 0.955 | 97.357 |
| Habit (HT) | 0.642 | 0.843 | 0.733 | HT1 | 0.801 | 12.631 |
|  |  |  |  | HT2 | 0.807 | 12.727 |
|  |  |  |  | HT3 | 0.795 | 10.768 |
| Behavioural intention (BI) | 0.840 | 0.940 | 0.904 | BI1 | 0.942 | 72.292 |
|  |  |  |  | BI2 | 0.864 | 24.996 |
|  |  |  |  | BI3 | 0.940 | 56.952 |

Table 2: Freemium's Quality Criteria and Factor Loadings

| Constructs | AVE | Composite <br> reliability | Cronbach's <br> alpha | Item | Loadings | t-value |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Performance | 0.688 | 0.868 | 0.773 | PE1 | 0.882 | 45.317 |
| Expectancy |  |  |  | PE2 | 0.763 | 16.286 |
| (PE) |  |  |  | PE3 | 0.839 | 23.797 |
| Effort | 0.758 | 0.926 | 0.895 | EE1 | 0.868 | 12.498 |
| Expectancy |  |  |  | EE2 | 0.913 | 21.242 |
| (EE) |  |  |  | EE3 | 0.916 | 18.537 |
|  |  |  |  | EE4 | 0.777 | 8.347 |
| Social | 0.841 | 0.941 | 0.906 | SI1 | 0.909 | 47.225 |
| Influence (SI) |  |  |  | SI2 | 0.920 | 47.059 |
|  |  |  | SI3 | 0.923 | 48.098 |  |


| Facilitating | 0.686 | 0.867 | 0.774 | FC1 | 0.801 | 7.080 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Conditions |  |  |  | FC2 | 0.836 | 6.636 |
| (FC) |  |  | 0.882 | HM1 | 0.898 | 47.841 |
| Hedonic | 0.808 | 0.927 |  | HM2 | 0.900 | 60.737 |
| Motivation |  |  |  | HM3 | 0.898 | 33.765 |
| (HM) |  |  | 0.954 | PV1 | 0.961 | 137.216 |
| Price Value | 0.916 | 0.970 |  | PV2 | 0.961 | 134.997 |
| (PV) |  |  |  |  | PV3 | 0.949 |
|  |  |  |  | HT1 | 0.892 | 111.411 |
| Habit (HT) | 0.828 | 0.935 |  | HT2 | 0.926 | 53.823 |
|  |  |  |  | HT3 | 0.921 | 64.971 |
|  |  |  |  | BI1 | 0.921 | 51.930 |
| Behavioural | 0.838 | 0.939 |  | BI2 | 0.918 | 49.362 |
| intention (BI) |  |  |  | BI3 | 0.907 | 50.142 |

Fornell \& Larcker (1981) and cross-loadings criteria were used to assess discriminant validity. This criterion is met (all diagonal values are greater than the off-diagonal values), as shown in Table 3 (premium model) and Table 4 (freemium model).

The measurement model results assure construct reliability, indicator reliability, convergent validity and discriminant validity of the constructs.

Table 3: Premium's Square Root of AVE (in bold on diagonal) and Factor Correlation Coefficients

| Const. | PE | EE | SI | FC | HM | PV | HT | BI |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| PE | 0.758 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| EE | 0.295 | .860 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| SI | 0.338 | 0.105 | 0.924 |  |  |  |  |  |
| FC | 0.323 | 0.514 | 0.107 | 0.795 |  |  |  |  |
| HM | 0.507 | 0.383 | 0.337 | 0.318 | 0.805 |  |  |  |
| PV | 0.464 | 0.239 | 0.274 | 0.392 | 0.459 | 0.947 | 0.801 | 0.916 |
| HT | 0.457 | 0.226 | 0.250 | 0.236 | 0.383 | 0.229 | 0.366 | 0.539 |
| BI | 0.517 | 0.427 | 0.222 | 0.561 | 0.511 | 0.59 |  |  |

Table 4: Freemium's Square Root of AVE (in bold on diagonal) and Factor Correlation Coefficients

| Const. | PE | EE | SI | FC | HM | PV | HT | BI |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| PE | 0.829 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| EE | 0.249 | 0.871 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| SI | 0.438 | 0.194 | 0.917 |  |  |  |  |  |
| FC | 0.203 | 0.559 | 0.230 | 0.828 |  |  |  |  |
| HM | 0.467 | 0.446 | 0.350 | 0.344 | 0.899 | 0.957 |  |  |
| PV | 0.466 | 0.175 | 0.401 | 0.321 | 0.387 | 0.910 |  |  |
| HT | 0.446 | 0.146 | 0.405 | 0.197 | 0.292 | 0.460 | 0.565 | 0.915 |
| BI | 0.503 | 0.221 | 0.468 | 0.190 | 0.502 | 0.545 | 0.50 |  |

Note (Table 3 and Table 4): PE - performance expectancy; EE - effort expectancy; SI - social influence; FC - facilitating conditions; HM - hedonic motivation; PV - price value; HT - habit; BI - behavioural intention

### 5.2. Structural Model

Once we have assumed that the construct measures are reliable and valid, the next step is assessing the structural results (Hair et al., 2014). First, we started to assess collinearity using the inner variance inflation factor (VIF). All variables showed VIFs smaller than 2, confirming the absence of collinearity problems. Next, the path significances were estimated using the bootstrapping technique, generating 5,000 bootstrap samples (Henseler et al., 2009). The results of the premium model are shown in Fig. 2 and Table 5 and the freemium model results are shown in Fig. 3 and Tabel 7.

According to Hair et al. (2014), coefficients of determination ( $R^{2}$ values) of $0.75,0.50$ and 0.25 are considered as substantial, moderate or weak, respectively. The premium model explains $53 \%$ of behavioural intention to adopt a paid music streaming service and the freemium model explains $52.5 \%$ of the same intention. Hence, both models can predict the substantive (above $50 \%)$ variation of the endogenous variables.

Analysing the path coefficients of the premium model, we observed the following results: $\mathrm{H} 1, \mathrm{H} 4, \mathrm{H} 5$ and H 6 are confirmed by the empirical results. Effort expectancy, social influence and habit were not validated, thus, $\mathrm{H} 2, \mathrm{H} 3$ and H 7 are not supported by the premium model.

Analysing the path coefficients of the freemium model we observed the following results: $\mathrm{H} 3, \mathrm{H} 5, \mathrm{H} 6$ and H 7 are confirmed by the empirical results. Performance expectancy, effort expectancy and facilitating conditions were not validated, thus, H1, H 2 and H 4 are not supported by the freemium model.

The structural premium model confirms 4 of the 7 hypotheses postulated, as well as the structural freemium model. We can find the differences between models in the Table 7.

Table 5: Premium's Results of the Structural Model and Hypotheses Testing

| $\#$ | Relationships | Expected sign | Path coeff. | t-value | p-value | Supported |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | ---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| H1 | Performance expectancy $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.169 | 2.114 | 0.035 | Yes* |
| H 2 | Effort expectancy $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.087 | 1.214 | 0.225 | No |
| H 3 | Social influence $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | -0.017 | 0.288 | 0.773 | No |
| H 4 | Facilitating conditions $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.299 | 3.076 | 0.002 | Yes* |
| H 5 | Hedonic motivation $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.161 | 2.051 | 0.040 | Yes* $^{*}$ |
| H 6 | Price value $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.232 | 2.815 | 0.005 | Yes* |
| H7 | Habit $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.091 | 1.044 | 0.297 | No |

Note: * $p<0.05$
Figure 2: Premium Structural Model Results


Note: Paths coefficients that are not statistically significant are in dashed arrows.
Table 6: Freemium's Results of the Structural Model and Hypotheses Testing

| $\#$ | Relationships | Expected sign | Path coeff. | t-value | p-value | Supported |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| H1 | Performance expectancy $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.093 | 1.421 | 0.155 | No |
| H 2 | Effort expectancy $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.029 | 0.490 | 0.624 | No |
| H 3 | Social influence $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.140 | 1.803 | 0.071 | Yes** |
| H 4 | Facilitating conditions $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | -0.099 | 1.593 | 0.111 | No |
| H 5 | Hedonic motivation $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.251 | 3.457 | 0.000 | Yes* |
| H6 | Price value $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.238 | 3.135 | 0.002 | Yes* |
| H7a | Habit $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | + | 0.299 | 4.027 | 0.000 | Yes* |

Note: * $p<0.05,{ }^{* *} p<0.10$

Figure 3: Freemium Structural Model Results


Note: Paths coefficients that are not statistically significant are in dashed arrows.
Table 7: Comparison of Results

| $\#$ | Relationships | Premium | Freemium |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| H 1 | Performance expectancy $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | Supported* | No |
| H 2 | Effort expectancy $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | No | No |
| H 3 | Social influence $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | No | No*, Supported** $^{\mathrm{H} 4}$ |
| Facilitating conditions $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | Supported* | No |  |
| H 5 | Hedonic motivation $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | Supported* | Supported* |
| H 6 | Price value $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | Supported* | Supported* |
| H7a | Habit $\rightarrow \mathrm{BI}$ | No | Supported* |

$$
\text { Note: *p<0.05, ** } p<0.10
$$

Additionally, following the paper of Barata \& Simões (2021) - reference for this work - , considering specific data and analyzes for Premium and for Freemium, the main results obtained were: i) In the Premium sample, the "performance expectation" influences the purchase intention, in the Freemium it does not; ii) "Social influence" is not taken into account in the Premium sample, however, at a significance level of 10\%, in the Freemium sample, its impact is verified; iii) The "access conditions" are taken into account by the Premium sample, not in the Freemium, being the factor that most influences the intention of use in the Premium sample; iv) "Hedonic motivation" and "Price-value" are the only variables that influence both samples, both Premium and Freemium, on the intention to use a paid streaming service; v) The "Habit" influences only the intention of use in the Freemium sample, which is the variable that most influences the intention of use in this sample.

## 6. DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS

Unsurprisingly, the majority of the constructs of the UTAUT2 model (Venkatesh et al., 2012) showed to be consistent, providing a valuable basis for future research in the music streaming services adoption topic.

Concerning the premium model, it is possible to observe that the variables which explain behavioural intention to buy a premium account are facilitating conditions, price value, performance expectancy and hedonic motivation. "Facilitating conditions" revealed to be the strongest determinant ( $\hat{\beta}=0.299, p=0.002$ ) in this model.
"Price value" also shown that it plays an essential part in the behavioural intention explanation ( $\hat{\beta}=0.232, p=0.005$ ). This finding is in line with the previous research performed by Venkatesh et al. (2012), where it was stated that a positive price
value means that the advantages of using technology are perceived to be greater than the monetary cost and, therefore, price value impacts positively on intention.
"Performance expectancy" was accepted as one of the determinants of behavioural intention ( $\hat{\beta}=0.169, p=0.035$ ), also corroborating the results of Venkatesh et al. (2012). This means that consumers who perceive benefits from using paid music streaming services are more likely to use them. In this context, the performance expectancy can be raised by improving tools to look for music, sorting algorithms, or simplifying sharing in other platforms (Hampton-Sosa, 2017).

Another determinant of behavioural intention is "hedonic motivation" ( $\hat{=}=0.161, p=0.040$ ). This result is in line with the findings of van der Heijden (2004), Chu \& Lu (2007), Venkatesh et al. (2012) and Hampton-Sosa (2017, 2019), evidencing the importance of the role of hedonic benefits in technology acceptance. In this model, effort expectancy, social influence and habit did not impact intention behavioural.

Concerning the freemium model, it is possible to observe that the variables which explain behavioural intention to buy a premium account are habit, hedonic motivation, price value and social influence. "Habit" revealed to be the strongest determinant ( $(\hat{\beta}=0.299, p=0.000$ ). This finding may arise from the fact that digitalisation has profoundly revolutionised music consumption by allowing it anytime and everywhere, which was not possible in the past (Cockrill et al., 2011).

Another determinant of behavioural intention is "hedonic motivation" ( $\widehat{\beta}=0.251, p=0.000$ ). This finding is in line with the previous result from premium model. This means that price value is taking into account by freemium users as well as premium users.

Concerning "price value", it was also shown that it plays an essential part in the behavioural intention explanation ( $\hat{\beta}=0.238$, $p=0.002$ ). This finding is in line with the previous result from premium model, meaning that price value is taking into account by freemium users as well as premium users. Social influence was proved too ( $\hat{\beta}=0.140, p=0.071$ ), ), considering as significance level, $\alpha=10 \%$. In this model, performance expectancy, effort expectancy and facilitating conditions did not impact intention behavioural.

## 7. LIMITATIONS AND FURTHER RESEARCH

Like other empirical studies, there are some limitations in our research that need to be considered. Firstly, a convenience sampling method was used. Therefore, we recommend caution in analysing the findings. Secondly, our research is centred on practical factors, and thus, the moderators of the UTAUT2 model (age, gender and experience) did not constitute the target of this analysis and consequently were not taken into account. This could be assumed as a limitation of our proposed extended model, according to the theory.
Future research may include adapting this study to other locations and submitting it to a larger number of participants to assure the generalisation of results. This study could be used as a basis for upcoming analysis by improving the model and testing it in some specific countries and age groups (Naranjo-Zolotov et al., 2019). The addition of new constructs to the present model would be helpful to try to increase the predictive power of our framework. Meanwhile, it might be interesting to deeply explore the effect of paid music streaming services in the abolition of music piracy, namely, to verify if this tendency of decrease remains.

## 8. CONCLUSIONS

This study sought to analyse which factors influence the intention to purchase a music streaming service, comparing premium and freemium user's results. To this end, several hypotheses were tested using UTAUT2. By analysing our results, it is possible to retain some fundamental insights that could be pertinent for music streaming services providers to perceive the adoption process of users.
Regarding the theoretical implications, in terms of the determinants of adoption for paid music streaming services, our findings suggest that several but not all of the original constructs of the UTAUT2 model are important determinants of music consumption behaviour, depending on the sample.

Concerning the practical implications, we can affirm that in the premium sample, performance expectancy influences adoption, however, in freemium sample, it does not. It is possible to observe that the effort expectancy is not considered by any premium and freemium users when deciding which account to purchase. Social influence is not taken into account in the premium sample, however, at a significance level of $10 \%$, in the freemium sample, its impact is verified in intention to adopt a premium account. Facilitating conditions are taken into account by the premium sample and not by freemium, being the factor that most influences the intention to use in the premium sample. Hedonic motivation and price value are the only variables that influence both samples, premium and freemium, on the intention to use a paid streaming service. Habit only influences the intention in the freemium sample, which is the variable that most impact the intention in this sample.

These conclusions may be used in the design of business strategies aiming to promote users from free to paid services, as companies will be able to understand the expected impact on adoption resulting from manipulating a mix of these drivers.

To conclude, we can state that the adoption intention in the world of music streaming is a complex and multidimensional context. Adoption models designed for traditional information systems adoption still appear to fit this framework partially, but new dimensions have emerged as relevant to explain behavioural intention in this new milieu. Music streaming services providers should continue bonding with users and potential users, focusing on their needs, and creating satisfaction and trust concerning the paid versions.

## REFERENCES

Aguiar, L., \& Waldfogel, J. (2018). As streaming reaches flood stage, does it stimulate or depress music sales? International Journal of Industrial Organization, 57, 278-307. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijindorg.2017.06.004

Ajzen, I. (1991). The theory of planned behavior. Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, 50(2), $179-211$. https://doi.org/10.1016/0749-5978(91)90020-T

Ajzen, I. (2002). Residual Effects of Past on Later Behavior: Habituation and Reasoned Action Perspectives. Personality and Social Psychology Review, 6(2), 107-122. https://doi.org/10.1207/S15327957PSPR0602_02

Arditi, D. (2014). ITunes: Breaking barriers and building walls. Popular Music and Society, 37(4), 408-424. https://doi.org/10.1080/03007766.2013.810849

Arditi, D. (2018). Digital subscriptions: the unending consumption of music in the digital era. Popular Music and Society, 41(3), 302-318. https://doi.org/10.1080/03007766.2016.1264101

Barata, M. \& Coelho, P. (2021). Music streaming services: understanding the drivers of customer purchase and intention to recommend. Heliyon, 7, 1-17. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e07783

Cesareo, L., \& Pastore, A. (2014). Consumers' attitude and behavior towards online music piracy and subscription-based services. Journal of Consumer Marketing, 31(6-7), 515-525. https://doi.org/10.1108/JCM-07-2014-1070

Chen, C. C., Leon, S., \& Nakayama, M. (2018a). Are you hooked on paid music streaming? An investigation into the millennial generation. International Journal of E-Business Research, 14(1), 1-20. https://doi.org/10.4018/IJEBR. 2018010101

Chen, C. C., Leon, S., \& Nakayama, M. (2018b). Converting music streaming free users to paid subscribers: Social influence or hedonic performance. International Journal of Electronic Business, 14(2), 128-145. https://doi.org/10.1504/IJEB.2018.094870
Cheong, J., \& Park, M. C. (2005). Mobile internet acceptance in Korea. Internet Research, 15(2), 125-140. https://doi.org/10.1108/10662240510590324

Chu, C., \& Lu, H. (2007). Factors influencing online music purchase intention in Taiwan: An empirical study based on the value-intention framework. Internet Research, 17(2), 139-155. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1108/10662240710737004

Churchill, G. A. (1979). A paradigm for developing better measures of marketing constructs. Journal of Marketing Research, 16(1), 64-73. https://doi.org/10.2307/3150876

Cockrill, A., Sullivan, M., \& Norbury, H. L. (2011). Music consumption: Lifestyle choice or addiction. Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, 18(2), 160-166. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2010.12.003

Davis, F. D. (1989). Perceived usefulness, perceived ease of use, and user acceptance of information technology. MIS Quarterly: Management Information Systems, 13(3), 319-339. https://doi.org/10.2307/249008

Dodds, W. B., Monroe, K. B., \& Grewal, D. (1991). Effects of price, brand, and store information on buyers' product evaluations. Journal of Marketing Research, 28(3), 307-319. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.2307/3172866

Doerr, J., Benlian, A., Vetter, J., \& Hess, T. (2010). Pricing of content services - An empirical investigation of usic as a service. Lecture Notes in Business Information Processing, 58, 13-24. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-15141-5_2

Dörr, J., Wagner, T. M., Hess, T., \& Benlian, A. (2013). Music as a service as an alternative to music piracy? An empirical investigation of the intention to use music streaming services. Business and Information Systems Engineering, 5(6), 383-396. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12599-013-0294-0

Fishbein, M., \& Ajzen, I. (1975). Belief, Attitude, Intention, and Behavior: An Introduction to Theory and Research. Addison-Wesley.
Fornell, C., \& Larcker, D. F. (1981). Evaluating structural equation models with unobservable variables and measurement error. Journal of Marketing Research, 18(1), 39-51. https://doi.org/10.2307/3151312

Hair, J. F. Jr., Hult, G. T. M., Ringle, C. M., \& Sarstedt, M. (2014). A Primer on Partial Least Squares Structural Equation Modeling (PLS-SEM) (2nd ed.). SAGE Publications.

Hampton-Sosa, W. (2017). The impact of creativity and community facilitation on music streaming adoption and digital piracy. Computers in Human Behavior, 69, 444-453. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2016.11.055

Henseler, J., Ringle, C. M., \& Sinkovics, R. R. (2009). The use of partial least squares path modeling in international marketing. Advances in International Marketing, 20(1), 277-319. https://doi.org/10.1108/S1474-7979(2009)0000020014
lacobucci, D., \& Churchill, G. A. (2018). Marketing Research: Methodological Foundations (12th ed., Issue September). CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform.

IFPI. (2020). Global Music Report 2019. International Federation of the Phonographic Industry (IFPI), 1-44.
Kim, S., \& Malhotra, N. (2005). A longitudinal model of continued IS use: An integrative view of four mechanisms underlying postadoption phenomena. Management Science, 51(5), 741-755. https://doi.org/10.1287/mnsc.1040.0326

Kwong, S. W., \& Park, J. (2008). Digital music services: Consumer intention and adoption. Service Industries Journal, 28(10), 1463-1481. https://doi.org/10.1080/02642060802250278

Larsen, G., Lawson, R., \& Todd, S. (2009). The consumption of music as self-representation in social interaction. Australasian Marketing Journal, 17(1), 16-26. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ausmj.2009.01.006

Larsen, G., Lawson, R., \& Todd, S. (2010). The symbolic consumption of music. Journal of Marketing Management, 26(7-8), 671-685. https://doi.org/10.1080/0267257X.2010.481865

Naranjo-Zolotov, M., Oliveira, T., \& Casteleyn, S. (2019). Citizens' intention to use and recommend e-participation: Drawing upon UTAUT and citizen empowerment. Information Technology and People, 32(2), 364-386. https://doi.org/10.1108/ITP-08-2017-0257

Naveed, K., Watanabe, C., \& Neittaanmäki, P. (2017). Co-evolution between streaming and live music leads a way to the sustainable growth of music industry - Lessons from the US experiences. Technology in Society, 50, 1-19. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techsoc.2017.03.005

Oestreicher-singer, G., \& Zalmanson, L. (2013). Content or community? A digital business strategy for content providers in the social age. MIS Quarterly: Management Information Systems, 37(2), 591-616. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.25300/MISQ/2013/37.2.12

Ringle, C. M., Wende, S., \& Becker, J.-M. (2015). SmartPLS 3.
Sinclair, G., \& Green, T. (2016). Download or stream? Steal or buy? Developing a typology of today's music consumer. Journal of Consumer Behaviour, 50(October), 35-50. https://doi.org/10.1002/cb. 1526

Sinclair, G., \& Tinson, J. (2017). Psychological ownership and music streaming consumption. Journal of Business Research, 71(September), 19. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2016.10.002

Thomes, T. P. (2013). An economic analysis of online streaming music services. Information Economics and Policy, 25(2), 81-91. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.infoecopol.2013.04.001
van der Heijden. (2004). User acceptance of hedonic information systems. MIS Quarterly, 28(4), 695-704. https://doi.org/10.2307/25148660
Venkatesh, V. (2000). Determinants of perceived ease of use: integrating control, intrinsic motivation, and emotion into the technology acceptance model. Information Systems Research, 11(4), 342-365. https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.11.4.342.11872

Venkatesh, V., \& Bala, H. (2008). Technology acceptance model 3 and a research agenda on interventions. Decision Sciences, 39(2), $273-315$. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-5915.2008.00192.x

Venkatesh, V., Morris, M. G., Davis, G. B., \& Davis, F. D. (2003). User acceptance of information technology: Toward a unified view. MIS Quarterly: Management Information Systems, 27(3), 425-478. https://doi.org/10.2307/30036540

Venkatesh, V., Thong, J. Y. L., \& Xu, X. (2012). Consumer acceptance and use of information technology: Extending the unified theory of acceptance and use of technology. MIS Quarterly: Management Information Systems, 36(1), 157-178. https://doi.org/10.2307/41410412

Wagner, T. M., Benlian, A., \& Hess, T. (2014). Converting freemium customers from free to premium-the role of the perceived premium fit in the case of music as a service. Electronic Markets, 24(4), 259-268. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12525-014-0168-4

Wang, Y.-S. (2008). Assessing e-commerce systems success: a respecification and validation of the DeLone and McLean model of IS success. 18, 529-557. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2575.2007.00268.x

Wlömert, N., \& Papies, D. (2016). On-demand streaming services and music industry revenues - Insights from Spotify's market entry. International Journal of Research in Marketing, 33(2), 314-327. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijresmar.2015.11.002

Ye, L. R., Zhang, Y. J., Nguyen, D.-D., \& Chiu, J. (2004). Fee-based Online Services: Exploring Consumers' Willingness to Pay. Journal of International Information Management, 13(2), 133-141.

Zimmer, S. J. (2018). Rise of Music Streaming. Salem Press Encyclopedia.

Appendix: Constructs, Items and References Employed

| Constructs | Code | Items | References |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Performance <br> Expectancy (PE) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PE1 } \\ & \text { PE2 } \\ & \text { PE3 } \end{aligned}$ | I find paid music streaming services useful in my daily life. Using paid music streaming services help me accomplish things more quickly. <br> Using paid music streaming services increase my productivity /performance. | (Venkatesh et al., 2012) |
| Effort <br> Expectancy (EE) | EE1 <br> EE2 <br> EE3 <br> EE4 | Learning how to use paid music streaming services is easy for me. My interaction with paid music streaming services is clear and understandable. <br> I find paid music streaming services easy to use. <br> It is easy for me to become skilful at using paid music streaming services. | (Venkatesh et al., 2012) |
| Social Influence (SI) | SI1 SI2 SI3 | People who are important to me think that I should use paid music streaming services. <br> People who influence my behaviour think that I should use paid music streaming services. <br> People whose opinions that I value prefer that I use paid music streaming services. | $\begin{aligned} & \text { (Venkatesh et al., } \\ & \text { 2012) } \end{aligned}$ |
| Facilitating Conditions (FC) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FC1 } \\ & \text { FC2 } \\ & \text { FC3 } \\ & \\ & \text { FC4* } \end{aligned}$ | I have the resources necessary to use paid music streaming services. <br> I have the knowledge necessary to use paid music streaming services. <br> A paid music streaming service is compatible with other technologies I use. <br> I can get help from others when I have difficulties using paid music streaming services. | (Venkatesh et al., 2012) |
| Hedonic Motivation (HM) | HM1 <br> HM2 <br> HM3 | Using paid music streaming services is fun Using paid music streaming services is enjoyable. Using paid music streaming services is very entertaining | (Venkatesh et al., 2012)(van der Heijden, 2004) |
| Price Value (PV) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PV1 } \\ & \text { PV2 } \\ & \text { PV3 } \end{aligned}$ | A paid music streaming service is reasonably priced. A paid music streaming service is a good value for the money. At the current price, a paid music streaming service provides a good value. | (Venkatesh et al., 2012) |
| Habit (HT) | HT1 <br> HT2 <br> HT3 | The use of paid music streaming services has become a habit for me. <br> I am addicted to using paid music streaming services. <br> I must use paid music streaming services. | $\begin{aligned} & \text { (Venkatesh et al., } \\ & \text { 2012) } \end{aligned}$ |
| Behavioural intention (BI) | BI1 <br> BI2 <br> BI3 | I intend to continue using paid music streaming services in the future. <br> I will always try to use paid music streaming services in my daily life. <br> I plan to use paid music streaming services in the near future. | (Venkatesh et al., 2012) |

[^0]
[^0]:    *: Removed item

